

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: American Homes 4 Rent Prop

DOCKET NO.: 16-02911.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 10-13-115-011

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent Prop, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies, of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. in Oak Lawn; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$10,670 **IMPR.:** \$51,219 **TOTAL:** \$61,889

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame construction with 1,560 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1996. Features of the home include a crawl-space foundation, central air conditioning and a 420 square-foot attached garage. The property has a 4,356 square-foot site and is located in Mundelein, Fremont Township, Lake County.

The appellant submitted evidence before the Property Tax Appeal Board claiming overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of the overvaluation claim, the appellant submitted limited descriptive information for three comparable sales.<sup>1</sup> The properties have from 4,356 to 5,663 square feet of land area and were reported as being located from 0.02 to 0.12 of a mile from the subject. The comparables were reported to consist of two-story dwellings that were built in 1996

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Board requested the appellant to complete the grid analysis in Section V of the appeal petition. The appellant failed to comply with the Board's request.

or 1997. The comparables were reported to have three bedrooms and two or three bathrooms. The appellant failed to disclose the comparables' exterior construction, foundation type or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces or garages. The dwellings contain either 1,439 or 1,516 square feet of living area. The comparables sold from August 2013 to March 2015 for prices ranging from \$160,000 to \$185,000 or from \$105.54 to \$128.56 per square foot of living area, land included. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$61,889. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$186,638 or \$119.64 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.16%.

The board of review presented information on three comparable sales with the same neighborhood code as the subject.<sup>2</sup> The properties have 4,356 or 4,791 square feet of land area and were reported as being located from 0.031 to 0.093 of a mile from the subject. The comparables are improved with two-story dwellings of frame construction. The dwellings were constructed in 1996 or 1997 and have from 1,522 to 1,560 square feet of living area. The comparables have crawl-space foundations, central air conditioning and attached garages with 420 or 445 square feet of building area. One comparable has a fireplace. The board of review comparables sold from August 2014 to July 2015 for prices ranging from \$169,000 to \$190,500 or from \$111.04 to \$122.90 per square foot of living area, land included.

As part of their submission, the board of review made reference to the subject's March 2015 sale for a price of \$130,500 or \$83.65 per square foot of living area, land included. The board of review stated the subject's sale was a court-ordered sheriff's sale. As documentation, the board of review presented a copy of the subject's transfer declaration which disclosed the property had not been advertised for sale and sold at auction as a court-ordered sale. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties presented sale prices for six comparable properties. The Board finds the appellant's comparables #1 and #2 and board of review comparable #2 sold from August 2013 to August 2014. The Board gave less weight to these comparables, because their sales were considered to be dated in relation to the January 1, 2016 assessment date. The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be the appellant's comparable #3 and board of review comparables #1 and #3. The Board finds these properties were very similar to the subject in location, story

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The board of review's information consisted of a completed grid analysis, photographic evidence and property records for the subject and their comparable sales.

height, age and living area and sold more proximate to the January 1, 2016 assessment date. These comparables sold from March to July 2015 for prices ranging from \$169,000 to \$190,500 or from \$111.04 to \$128.56 per square foot of living area, land included. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$186,638 or \$119.64 per square foot of living area, land included, which falls within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant was not able to demonstrate that the subject was overvalued and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

M	and Illorios
	Chairman
21. Fer	a R
Member	Member
assert Stoffen	Dan De Kinie
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## **CERTIFICATION**

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	August 21, 2018
	0 m/
_	Stee M Wagner
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

## **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

American Homes 4 Rent Prop, by attorney: Michael R. Davies
Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd.
5533 West 109th Street, Unit 219
Oak Lawn, IL 60453

## **COUNTY**

Lake County Board of Review 18 North County Street 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085