

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Sean Carroll

DOCKET NO.: 16-02316.001-R-2 PARCEL NO.: 16-06-403-051

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Sean Carroll, the appellant; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>A Reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Lake County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$194,521 **IMPR.:** \$262,927 **TOTAL:** \$457,448

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

# **Findings of Fact**

The subject property is improved with a two-story single-family dwelling of brick exterior construction. The dwelling was built in 1998 and contains 6,383 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a full unfinished basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces and a 1,258-square foot attached garage. The dwelling is located in Lake Forest, West Deerfield Township, Lake County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on six comparable sales located between 0.45 of a mile to 4.94 miles of the subject. One of the comparables has the same neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables consist of one, one-story and five, two-story single-family dwellings of brick, frame or stucco exterior construction which were built from 1990 to 2005. The dwellings range in size from 5,015 to 6,383 square feet of living area. The comparables each have a full or partial basement, two with a finished area, central air conditioning, and two to four fireplaces. Four of

the comparables have an attached garage ranging in size from 658 to 1,024-square feet of building area. Two of the comparables have two attached garages containing 1,110 or 1,262-square feet of combined building area. Two of the comparables each have a pool. The comparables sold from November 2014 to December 2016 for prices ranging from \$945,000 to \$1,350,000 or from \$161.37 to \$255.43 per square foot of living area, including land.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested an assessment reflecting a market value of approximately \$1,253,307 or \$196.35 per square foot of living area, land included, based on the 2016 three-year median level of assessment for Lake County.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$556,574. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,678,450 or \$262.96 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.16% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales located between 0.408 to 0.759 of a mile of the subject. None of the comparables have the same neighborhood code as the subject. The comparables consist of one, one and one-half-story; one, one and three-quarter story; and one, two-story single-family dwelling of frame or brick exterior construction. The homes were built between 1991 and 2004 and range in size from 5,391 to 6,440 square feet of living area. Features of the comparables include a full or partial unfinished basement, central air conditioning, and two or four fireplaces. Two of the comparables each have a detached garage of 800 or 850-square feet of building area. One comparable has one attached garage and one detached garage of 528 and 538-square feet of building area, respectively. One of the comparables has a pool. The comparables sold from May 2015 to August 2016 for prices ranging from \$1,500,000 to \$2,390,000 or from \$278.24 to \$371.12 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on the foregoing evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The parties presented sales data for nine suggested comparable properties for the Board's consideration. The appellant's comparables #1, #4, #5, and #6 received reduced weight by the Board as comparable #1 has a much smaller dwelling area compared to the subject; comparable #4 is a smaller dwelling with a smaller basement area and is of one-story design, dissimilar to the subject; comparable #5 has a smaller dwelling area and full finished basement, dissimilar to the subject; comparables #4 and #5 each have a pool, dissimilar to the subject; and comparable #6 is almost 5 miles distance from the subject and its 2014 sale is dated and thus less indicative of fair market value as of the subject's January 1, 2016 assessment date. The board of review's

comparables received reduced weight by the Board as comparables #1 and #2 are of dissimilar design when compared to the subject's two-story design; comparables #1 and #3 have smaller dwelling areas compared to the subject; comparable #1 has only a partial basement, dissimilar to the subject; and comparable #3 has a pool, dissimilar to the subject The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appellant's comparables #2 and #3 as these dwellings are most similar to the subject in location, design, foundation type, and most features. These comparables sold in February and September 2016 for prices of \$960,000 and \$1,350,000 or \$161.37 and \$213.67 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of approximately \$1,678,450 or \$262.96 per square foot of living area, including land, which is not supported by the most similar comparables in the record. After considering adjustments for differences in dwelling size and some features, the Board finds that a reduction in the subject's assessment is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mauro Illorioso	
	Chairman
21. Fe	R
Member	Member
assert Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: August 21, 2018

Star Mhagner

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

Sean Carroll 1030 Newcastle Drive Lake Forrest, IL 60045

# **COUNTY**

Lake County Board of Review 18 North County Street 7th Floor Waukegan, IL 60085