

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Gary Moberly
DOCKET NO.:	16-01107.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.:	21-14-02-211-004-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Gary Moberly, the appellant, by Jessica Hill-Magiera, Attorney at Law in Lake Zurich; and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>no change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Will** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$5,631
IMPR.:	\$18,488
TOTAL:	\$24,119

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a one-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 1,092 square feet of living area built on a concrete slab foundation. The dwelling is approximately 63 years old. Features of the home include a detached garage with 500 square feet of building area.¹ The property has a 7,304-square foot site and is located in Park Forest, Monee Township, Will County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on nine comparable sales located within .59 of a mile from the subject property.

¹ The property record card for the subject states that the garage contains 360 square feet of building area. However, the same property record card has a schematic drawing depicting the dimensions of the garage having a total of 500 square feet of building area.

The comparables are described as one-story single-family dwellings each containing 1,092 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 1953 to 1957 on a concrete slab foundation. Each comparable has a garage ranging in size from 240 to 484 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from May 2015 to April 2016 for prices ranging from \$7,500 to \$45,000 or from \$6.87 to \$41.21 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's total assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$24,119. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$72,517 or \$66.41 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Will County of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales located within the same neighborhood as the subject. The comparables are improved with one-story single-family dwellings of frame exterior construction built on a slab foundation and each containing 1,092 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 1952 to 1957. Two comparables have central air-conditioning and each has a garage ranging in size from 280 to 352 square feet of building area. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 7,011 to 7,441 square feet of land area. The comparables sold in March 2014 or February 2015 for prices ranging from \$81,500 to \$111,161 or from \$74.63 to \$101.80 per square foot of living area, including land. The board of review submitted property record cards for the subject as well as their three comparables. In addition, the board of review submitted a brief prepared by the Monee Township Assessor contesting the accuracy and insufficiency of the appellant's comparables. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In rebuttal, the appellant submitted a brief critiquing the board of review comparables and contending that calculating the median price per square foot more accurately reflects market value.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

As an initial matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board gave no weight to the appellants' argument that the Board should adopt a standard practice of using the median sale price per square foot of living area, including land, of those comparables deemed best in determining fair market value because it is "more accurate." Contrary to this argument, the decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board must be based upon equity and the weight of evidence, not upon a simplistic statistical formula of using the median sale price per square foot of living area, including land, of those comparables determined to be most similar to the subject. (35 ILCS 200/16-185; Chrysler

Corp. v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 69 Ill.App.3d 207 (2nd Dist. 1979); <u>Mead v. Board of Review</u>, 143 Ill.App.3d 1088 (2nd Dist. 1986); <u>Ellsworth Grain Co. v. Property Tax Appeal Board</u>, 172 Ill.App.3d 552 (4th Dist. 1988); <u>Willow Hill Grain</u>, Inc. v. Property Tax Appeal Board, 187 Ill.App.3d 9 (5th Dist. 1989)). Based upon the foregoing legal principles and contrary to the assertion of the appellants' counsel in the rebuttal brief, there is no indication that a "median sale price per square foot" is the fundamental or primary means to determine market value.

The Board finds the parties submitted for the Board's consideration a total of twelve suggested sale comparables with various degrees of similarity to the subject property. The Board gave less weight to appellant's comparable #6 as this sale appears to be an outlier compared to the rest of the comparable sales submitted by the parties. The remaining eleven comparables sold for prices ranging from \$21,200 to \$111,161 or from \$19.41 to \$101.80 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$72,517 or \$66.41 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. Based on this evidence, the Board finds that the appellant did not prove by preponderance of evidence that the subject is overvalued. Therefore, no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

~ 1 = Far	Chairman
Member	Member
dovert Stoffen	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

September 17, 2019

Mano Allorino

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Gary Moberly, by attorney: Jessica Hill-Magiera Attorney at Law 790 Harvest Drive Lake Zurich, IL 60047

COUNTY

Will County Board of Review Will County Office Building 302 N. Chicago Street Joliet, IL 60432