

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: American Residential Lease

DOCKET NO.: 16-01023.001-R-1

PARCEL NO.: 21-14-13-214-006-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Residential Lease, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies, of Ryan Law LLP in Chicago; and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *no change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Will** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$4,994 **IMPR.:** \$20,465 **TOTAL:** \$25,459

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a one-story single-family dwelling of masonry exterior construction with 1,109 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 43 years old. The dwelling was built on a concrete slab foundation. The property is situated on a 7,073-square foot site and is located in Monee Township, Will County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted limited evidence in Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal petition disclosing the subject property was purchased in July 2013 from "Wilma Dandridge" for a price of \$40,000. While the appellant was requested to provide additional information to complete the appeal by letter dated November 30, 2017 by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the appeal was

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The appellant did not provide any description of the property. The description of the subject was gleaned from the evidence provided by the board of review.

accepted, and the board of review was simultaneously but separately notified of its duty to respond to the appeal within 90 days. Based on this limited recent sale evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the 2013 purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$25,459. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$76,545 or \$69.02 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessments of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located within the same neighborhood code as defined by the local assessor. The comparables are improved with one-story single-family dwellings of masonry exterior construction ranging in size from 1,028 to 1,634 square feet of living area. The dwellings range in age from 43 to 55 years old. Two comparables features an unfinished basement and central air conditioning, and three have a garage ranging in size from 192 to 484 square feet of building area. The comparables are situated on sites ranging from 7,276 to 9,994 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from February to December 2015 for prices ranging from \$40,250 to \$120,000 or from \$39.15 to \$97.80 per square foot of living area, including land. The board of review also submitted property record cards for the subject as well as their own comparables, copies of the PTAX-203 forms for the subject's subsequent sales and a narrative brief contending that the subject is correctly assessed. Based on the foregoing evidence and argument, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's total assessment.

## **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

As an initial matter, the Board gave little weight to the appellant's sale due to little information regarding the sale being provided by the appellant to allow the Property Tax Appeal Board to conduct a meaningful analysis of the sale transaction. In addition, there was no evidence presented by the appellant that the sale transaction had any of the elements of an arm's length transaction. The board of review submitted a PTAX-203 form for this sale indicating that this was a sale between unrelated parties, the property was advertised or exposed on the open market prior to the sale and appears to be a transaction between a willing seller and a willing buyer. However, there were no other closing documents provided such as a settlement statement or contract for purchase in order for the Board to meaningfully analyze as to whether this was an arm's length transaction. Furthermore, the Board finds that the sale of the subject property occurred in July 2013 which is too remote in time from the subject's assessment date of January 1, 2016 to be reflective of market value.

The Board gave less weight to board of review comparable #4 due to its superior larger dwelling size in relation to the subject. The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be the remaining three comparable sales submitted by the board of review. These comparables were similar to the subject in location, style, construction, dwelling size, age and features. These properties also sold more proximate in time to the assessment date at issue. The comparables sold from February to December 2015 for prices ranging from \$40,250 to \$120,000 or from \$39.15 to \$97.80 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$76,545 or \$69.02 per square foot of living area, land included, which is within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the subject's assessment is reflective of market value and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman Z. J. Farri	<u> </u>
Member	Member
Astort Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:CERTIFICATION	
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and compl. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above the complete of the compl	the keeper of the Records thereof, I do ete Final Administrative Decision of the

Date: September 17, 2019

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Mano Illorios

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

## **AGENCY**

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

## **APPELLANT**

American Residential Lease, by attorney:
Michael R. Davies
Ryan Law LLP
311 South Wacker Drive
Mailbox #29
Chicago, IL 60606

## **COUNTY**

Will County Board of Review Will County Office Building 302 N. Chicago Street Joliet, IL 60432