

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: AMH 2014-2 Borrower LLC

DOCKET NO.: 16-00907.001-R-1

PARCEL NO.: 05-06-12-107-009-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are AMH 2014-2 Borrower LLC, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies, of Ryan Law LLP, in Chicago, and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Will** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$12,550 IMPR.: \$44,300 TOTAL: \$56,850

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame construction with 1,776 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1995. Features of the home include a full basement, central air conditioning and a fireplace. The property has a 10,087 square foot site and is located in Joliet, Troy Township, Will County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted limited evidence in Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal petition disclosing the subject property was purchased in October 2013 from "Sheriff of Will County" for a price of \$101,000. While the appellant was requested to provide additional information to complete the appeal, by letter dated August 10, 2017 by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the appeal was accepted and the board of review was simultaneously, but separately, notified of its

duty to respond to the appeal within 90 days. Based on this limited recent sale evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the 2013 purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$56,850. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$170,926 or \$96.24 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three year average median level of assessment for Will County of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

Initially in response to the appeal, the board of review and township assessor both suggested dismissal of the appeal since the appellant failed to comply with the Property Tax Appeal Board's request for additional information. The township assessor further noted that the incomplete checklist suggested that the sale of the subject property was "too old" to be indicative of market value.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales identified by the township assessor improved with two-story dwellings of frame or frame with brick trim construction containing either 1,651 or 1,776 square feet of living area that were located within the subject's subdivision. The dwellings were constructed between 1994 and 1997 with full basements and central air conditioning. Three comparables each have a fireplace and three comparables each have a garage of either 440 or 576 square feet of building area. These properties sold between October 1996 and August 2015 for prices ranging from \$129,000 to \$239,900 or from \$72.64 to \$135.08 per square foot of living area.

Based on the foregoing evidence and argument, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted evidence of the subject's 2013 sale price and four comparable sales to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board.

The Board gave little weight to the subject's October 2013 sale due to the fact the sale did not occur as proximate in time to the assessment date at issue of January 1, 2016 as did board of review comparable sale #1. In addition, there was no evidence presented by the appellant that the sale transaction had any of the elements of an arm's length transaction as there was no indication if the property sold between related parties; there was no indication whether the property was advertised or exposed on the open market prior to the sale; and/or there was no evidence whether the transaction occurred between a willing seller and a willing buyer. In fact,

the notation that the property sold by the "Sheriff of Will County" suggests that duress may have been involved in the transaction.

The Board also gave little weight to comparables #2, #3 and #4 presented by the board of review as these sales occurred between 1996 and 2005, dates that are not proximate to the valuation date at issue of January 1, 2016 and thus are less likely to be indicative of market value as of the assessment date.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be comparable sale #1 submitted by the board of review. The comparable was similar to the subject in location, style, construction, size, features and/or age. The property also sold more proximate in time to the assessment date at issue than the October 2013 sale of the subject property. The comparable sold in August 2015 for \$175,000 or for \$106.00 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$170,926 or \$96.24 per square foot of living area, including land, which is below the best comparable sale in this record in terms of both overall value and on a per-square-foot basis which also appears to be logical given the subject's lack of garage feature when compared to comparable sale #1.

After considering the best comparable sales in the record, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that the subject is not overvalued and no reduction in the assessment of the subject property is warranted.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

| Chairman Z. L. Fee | |
|---|------------|
| Member | Member |
| Sobert Stoffen | Dan Dikini |
| Member | Member |
| DISSENTING: | |
| CERTIFICATIO | <u>O N</u> |
| As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and comple | |

Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this

Date: August 20, 2019

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Mano Illorios

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

AMH 2014-2 Borrower LLC, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Ryan Law LLP 311 South Wacker Drive Mailbox #29 Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

Will County Board of Review Will County Office Building 302 N. Chicago Street Joliet, IL 60432