



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: American Homes 4 Rent Pro
DOCKET NO.: 16-00753.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 06-03-20-104-017-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent Pro, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies of Ryan Law, LLP, in Chicago; and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the Will County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$11,286
IMPR.: \$79,735
TOTAL: \$91,021

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 2,822 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2009. Features include a full basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a 713 square foot garage. The subject property has a 9,300 square foot site. The subject property located in Plainfield Township, Will County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant partially completed Section IV of the Residential Appeal petition indicating the subject property was purchased in January 2015 from the Will County Sheriff for a price of \$174,000. The appeal was returned for being incomplete. Appellant's legal counsel was ordered to fully complete Section IV of the appeal petition and to provide corroborating documentation regarding the sale. Appellant's counsel failed to respond to the Board's order. Nonetheless, the appeal

was accepted and the board of review was simultaneously, but separately, notified of its duty to respond to the appeal within 90 days. Based on this limited recent sale evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the 2015 purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$91,021. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$273,665 or \$96.98 per square foot of living area including land when applying the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Will County of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In response to the appeal, the board of review through the township assessor requested dismissal of the appeal since the appellant failed to comply with the Property Tax Appeal Board's request for additional information. The board of review also pointed out the subject sold in December 2014 and not January 2015 as reported by the appellant's attorney.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales located in the same neighborhood as the subject. The evidence was prepared by the township assessor. The comparables consist of two-story dwellings of frame exterior construction that were built from 2006 to 2008. The dwellings range in size from 2,920 to 3,227 square feet of living area and are situated in sites that contain from 11,000 to 14,900 square feet of land area. Features include full basements, central air conditioning, one fireplace and garages that contain from 630 to 672 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from September 2015 to August 2016 for prices ranging from \$340,000 to \$389,000 or from \$110.99 to \$120.55 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested an increase of the subject's assessment to reflect the median sale price of its comparables of \$116.44 per square foot of living area including land, which would result in a total assessment of \$109,531.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board gave no weight to the subject's December 2014 sale. The Board finds there was no evidence presented by the appellant that the sale meets the key fundamental elements of an arm's-length transaction to be considered reflective of market value. The appellant's attorney failed to disclose if the property sold between related parties; there was no indication whether the property was advertised or exposed to the open market prior to the sale; and there was no evidence whether the transaction occurred between a willing seller and a willing buyer. The evidence also disclosed the property sold by the Will County Sheriff, which calls into question the arm's-length nature of the transaction. In addition, the appellant's attorney failed to submit any corroborating evidence associated with the sale of the subject property such as a Real Estate Transfer Declaration, Settlement Statement or sales contract disclosing the terms of the sale.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the comparable sales submitted by the board of review. These comparables were similar to the subject in location, design, age, dwelling size, features and sold proximate in time to the assessment date at issue. The comparables sold from September 2015 to August 2016 for prices ranging from \$340,000 to \$389,000 or from \$110.99 to \$120.55 per square foot of living area including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$273,665 or \$96.98 per square foot of living area including land, which falls well below the range established by the most similar comparable sales contained in this record.

The board of review requested to increase the subject's assessment based upon the median per square foot sale price of the three comparable sales. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds the subject's current improvement assessment of \$79,735 or \$28.25 per square foot of living area falls below the range of the board of review comparables that have improvement assessments ranging from \$84,017¹ to \$100,737, but within the range of the comparables on a per square foot basis, which ranged from \$26.04 to \$34.00. Although the Will County Board of Review requested to increase the subject's total assessment to \$108,293, the Board finds the increase would result in an inequitable improvement assessment for the subject property of \$98,245 or \$35.17 per square foot of living area.

Based on this record, the Board finds no change in the subject's assessment is warranted.

¹ The Board finds it troubling this comparable sold for the highest sale price but has the lowest assessment of all the comparables.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman



Member



Member

Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: August 20, 2019



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

American Homes 4 Rent Pro, by attorney:
Michael R. Davies
Ryan Law LLP
311 South Wacker Drive
Mailbox #29
Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

Will County Board of Review
Will County Office Building
302 N. Chicago Street
Joliet, IL 60432