

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: American Homes 4 Rent Pro

DOCKET NO.: 16-00678.001-R-1

PARCEL NO.: 05-06-04-406-010-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent Pro, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies, of Ryan Law LLP, in Chicago, and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Will** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$14,200 IMPR.: \$52,450 TOTAL: \$66,650

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a part two-story and part one-story dwelling of frame with brick trim construction with 2,046 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2003. Features of the home include a partial basement, central air conditioning and a 528 square foot garage. The property has a 15,207 square foot site and is located in Shorewood, Troy Township, Will County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted limited evidence in Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal petition disclosing the subject property was purchased from "Fannie Mae AKA" in March 2013 for a price of \$179,000. While the appellant was requested to provide additional information to complete the appeal, by letter dated November 30, 2017 by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the appeal was accepted and the board of review was simultaneously, but separately, notified of its

duty to respond to the appeal within 90 days. Based on this limited recent sale evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the 2013 purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$66,650. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$200,391 or \$97.94 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three year average median level of assessment for Will County of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In response to the appellant's appeal, the board of review through the township assessor requested dismissal of the appeal for failure to comply with the incomplete checklist.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review through the township assessor submitted information on three comparable sales located in the subject's neighborhood. The comparables consist of part two-story and part one-story frame or frame with brick trim dwellings that were built between 2003 and 2005. The homes range in size from 1,780 to 2,563 square feet of living area and feature full or partial basements, central air conditioning and a garage ranging in size from 400 to 484 square feet of building area. Two of the comparables each have a fireplace. The comparables sold between November 2014 and June 2016 for prices ranging from \$180,000 to \$298,000 or from \$96.56 to \$116.27 per square foot of living area, including land.

Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be comparable sales #1 and #2 submitted by the board of review. These comparables were similar to the subject in location, style, construction, features and age with partial basements like the subject. These properties also sold proximate in time to the assessment date at issue as compared to the subject's sale in 2013. These two comparables sold in September 2015 and June 2016 for prices of \$180,000 and \$236,000 or for \$96.56 and \$101.12 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$200,391 or \$97.94 per square foot of living area, including land, which is bracketed by the best comparable sales in this record.

The Board gave little weight to the subject's March 2013 sale due to the fact the sale did not occur proximate in time to the assessment date at issue of January 1, 2016 and there was no evidence presented by the appellant that the sale transaction had any of the elements of an arm's length transaction as there was no indication if the property sold between related parties; there

was no indication whether the property advertised or exposed on the open market prior to the sale; and/or there was no evidence whether the transaction occurred between a willing seller and a willing buyer. The Board also gave less weight to board of review comparable sale #3 due to its larger dwelling size, full basement and the fact that the sale price appears to be an outlier.

Based on this record the Board finds the subject's assessment is reflective of market value and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chair Chair	irman
Member	Member
asort Stoffen	Dane De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>	
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and c Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in	omplete Final Administrative Decision of the

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Mauro Illorias

July 16, 2019

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Date:

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

American Homes 4 Rent Pro, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Ryan Law LLP 311 South Wacker Drive Mailbox #29 Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

Will County Board of Review Will County Office Building 302 N. Chicago Street Joliet, IL 60432