



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: American Homes 4 Rent Pro
DOCKET NO.: 16-00621.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 05-06-17-107-049-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent Pro, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. in Oak Lawn; and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the Will County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$9,350
IMPR.: \$33,700
TOTAL: \$43,050

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story end unit townhome of frame exterior construction with 1,616 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2003. Features of the townhome include a slab foundation, central air conditioning, two and one-half bathrooms and a 400 square foot garage. The property has a 5,983 square foot site and is located in Shorewood, Troy Township, Will County.

The appellants contend overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellants submitted information on four comparables located in the same subdivision as the subject property.¹ The appellant's comparable #4 has two reported sales. The comparables

¹ The appellant's grid analysis was void of some pertinent descriptive data, which was drawn from the evidence provided by the board of review.

consist of two-story townhomes of frame exterior construction that have either 1,484 or 1,616 square feet of living area.² The dwellings were constructed in 2003. Each townhome has a slab foundation, central air conditioning, two comparables have one and one-half bathrooms and the remaining two comparables have two and one-half bathrooms. Each comparable has a 380 or 400 square foot garage. Two of the comparables are end units and the remaining two comparables are inside units. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 3,443 to 6,605 square feet of land area.³ The comparables sold from January 2016 to October 2016 for prices ranging from \$126,000 to \$165,000 or from \$77.97 to \$102.10 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$43,050. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$129,435 or \$80.10 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Will County of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

The board of review submitted a letter from the Troy Township Assessor's Office along with additional data. The assessor asserted the subject is assessed below its reported February 2015 sale price of \$130,000 or \$80.45 per square foot of living area, including land. The assessor claims the appellant's grid analysis contained errors and omitted information. Once the information was corrected and the grid analysis completed, the data supports the value that has been placed upon this property.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales located in the same subdivision as the subject property. Board of review comparable #4 and appellant's comparable #1 are the same property. The comparables consist of two-story end unit townhomes of frame exterior construction with 1,616 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 2003 to 2005. Each townhome has a slab foundation, central air conditioning, two and one-half bathrooms and a 400 square foot garage. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 6,160 to 6,728 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from August 2014 to May 2016 for prices ranging from \$138,500 to \$165,500 or from \$85.71 to \$102.41 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or

² The Board finds the best evidence of size of the appellant's comparable #4 was presented by the board of review located in the property record card which contained the subject's size.

³ The parties differ as to the site sizes of the appellant's comparables #2 and #4. The Board finds the small discrepancy will not impact the Board's decision in this appeal.

construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The parties submitted seven suggested comparables for the Board's consideration with one comparable having two reported sales. The Board gave less weight to the appellant's comparables #2 and #3 due to their inside unit location, smaller size and fewer bathrooms when compared to the subject. The Board also gave less weight to board of review comparable #1 as its 2014 sale date is less proximate in time to the lien date in question and less likely to reflect the subject's market value as of the January 1, 2016 assessment date. Additionally, the Board gave little weight to the subject's reported February 2015 sale price, as the board of review provided no evidence that the sale in 2015 was an arms-length transaction.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the parties common comparable, the appellant's comparable #4 which sold twice in 2016, along with board of review comparables #2 and #3. These four comparables sold more proximate in time to the January 1, 2016 assessment date. They are most similar to the subject in location, size, design, age and features. These comparables sold from January 2016 to October 2016 for prices ranging from \$126,000 to \$165,500 or from \$77.97 to \$102.41 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$129,435 or \$80.10 per square foot of living area, including land, which falls within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. Based on this evidence, the Board finds no reduction in the subject's assessment is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman



Member



Member

Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: May 21, 2019



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

American Homes 4 Rent Pro, by attorney:
Michael R. Davies
Ryan Law LLP
311 South Wacker Drive
Mailbox #29
Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

Will County Board of Review
Will County Office Building
302 N. Chicago Street
Joliet, IL 60432