

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: AMH 2015-1 Borrower LLC

DOCKET NO.: 16-00561.001-R-1

PARCEL NO.: 05-06-06-118-015-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are AMH 2015-1 Borrower LLC, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies of Ryan Law LLP in Chicago; and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Will** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$12,250 IMPR.: \$48,200 TOTAL: \$60,450

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a part two-story and part one-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 1,809 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2006. Features of the home include a full basement, central air conditioning and a 484 square foot garage. The property has a 7,711 square foot site and is located in Troy Township, Will County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted limited evidence in Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal petition disclosing the subject property was purchased in February 2014 from PNC Bank National for a price of \$158,000. Appellant's legal counsel was requested to provide additional information to complete the appeal within 30 days. Appellant's counsel failed to respond by the established deadline. Nonetheless, the appeal was accepted and the board of review was simultaneously, but separately, notified of its duty to respond to the appeal within 90 days. Based on this limited

recent sale evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the 2014 purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$60,450. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$181,750 or \$100.47 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Will County of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. The subject has an improvement assessment of \$48,200 or \$26.64 per square foot of living area.

Initially, in response to the appeal, the board of review through the township assessor requested dismissal of the appeal since the appellant failed to comply with the Property Tax Appeal Board's request for additional information.

Alternatively, if the appeal was not dismissed, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales that are located in the same subdivision as the subject property. The comparables are improved with part two-story and part one-story dwellings of frame or frame and brick trim exterior construction that were built between 2004 and 2006. The homes contain either 1,787 or 1,809 square feet of living area. The comparables each have a basement, central air conditioning and a 484 square foot garage. In addition, one comparable has a fireplace. The dwellings are situated on sites ranging in size from 7,904 to 10,173 square feet of land area. The sales occurred from May 2014 to May 2016 for prices ranging from \$179,000 to \$203,000 or from \$100.17 to \$112.22 per square foot of living area, including land. These comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$45,200 to \$48,850 or from \$25.29 to \$27.00 per square foot of living area.

Based on this evidence, the board of review requested the subject's total assessment be increased to \$66,327 with an improvement assessment of \$54,077 or \$29.89 per square foot of living area based on the "median sale per square foot" of the comparables presented.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board gave less weight to the 2014 sale of board of review comparable #4 which is dated and less likely to be indicative of the subject's market value as of the January 1, 2016 assessment date. The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be the remaining three comparable sales submitted by the board of review. These comparables were similar to the subject in location, dwelling size, design, age and most features. These properties also sold proximate in time to the assessment date at issue. The comparables sold for prices ranging from \$187,000 to \$203,000 or from \$103.37 to \$112.22 per square foot of living area, including land.

The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$181,750 or \$100.47 per square foot of living area, including land, which is below the range established by the board of review comparables.

The Board gave little weight to the subject's sale due to the fact the sale did not occur proximate in time to the assessment date at issue. Furthermore, the appellant failed to fully complete Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the appeal and provide evidence demonstrating the purchase had the elements of an arm's-length transaction. Based on this record, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment based on overvaluation is not justified.

As to the board of review request to increase the subject's assessment based upon the median of the three recent sales, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds that the subject's current improvement assessment is within the range of the board of review comparable sales. The Will County Board of Review has requested an increase in the subject's improvement assessment to \$54,077 which would be \$29.89 per square foot of living area, which is greater than the persquare-foot improvement assessments of each of the board of review comparable sales. The Board finds an increase in the assessment as requested by the board of review is not justified based on principles of uniformity when comparing the requested assessment to the assessments of the comparables submitted by the board of review. Based on this record, the Property Tax Appeal Board finds a change in the subject's assessment is not justified.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chairman Z. L. Free	<u> </u>
Member	Member
Asbert Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
CERTIFICATION	<u>O N</u>
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete	

Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this

Date: October 15, 2019

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Mano Illorios

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

AMH 2015-1 Borrower LLC, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Ryan Law LLP 311 South Wacker Drive Mailbox #29 Chicago, IL 60606

COUNTY

Will County Board of Review Will County Office Building 302 N. Chicago Street Joliet, IL 60432