

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: American Homes 4 Rent TRS

DOCKET NO.: 16-00538.001-R-1

PARCEL NO.: 11-04-20-101-065-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent TRS, the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies, of Ryan Law LLP in Chicago; and the Will County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Will** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$13,482 **IMPR.:** \$50,179 **TOTAL:** \$63,661

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Will County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame construction with 2,276 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2004. Features of the home include a basement, central air conditioning and a 400 square foot garage. The property has a 6,000 square foot site and is located in Crest Hill, Lockport Township, Will County.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted limited evidence in Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal petition disclosing the subject property was purchased in September 2013 from the Sheriff of Will County for a price of \$167,600. While the appellant was requested to provide additional information to complete the appeal, by letter dated November 30, 2017 by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the appeal was accepted and the board of review was simultaneously, but separately, notified of its duty to respond to the appeal within 90 days. Based on this limited

recent sale evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the 2013 purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$63,661. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$191,404 or \$84.10 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Will County of 33.26% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

Initially in response to the appeal, the board of review requested the appeal be dismissed due to insufficient documentation. The board of review submitted a letter purported to be from the Lockport Township assessor. The assessor noted that the sale in 2013 is not recent and the appellant failed to provide copies of the property record cards or the PTAX forms.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales improved with two-story dwellings of frame construction ranging in size from 1,786 to 2,042 square feet of living area that were located within the subject's subdivision. The dwellings were constructed from 2002 to 2004. Each home features a basement, central air conditioning and a garage ranging in size from 400 to 504 square feet of building area. In addition, two comparables have a fireplace. The comparables have sites ranging in size from 6,000 to 7,714 square feet of land area. These properties sold from June 2015 to July 2016 for prices ranging from \$192,000 to \$218,000 or from \$97.94 to \$118.70 per square foot of living area, including land. In further support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted a copy of the property record card, along with a copy of the PTAX-203 Illinois Real Estate Transfer Declaration form relating to each comparable sale. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The parties submitted evidence of the subject's 2013 sale price and four comparable sales to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board.

The Board gave little weight to the subject's September 2013 sale due to the fact the sale did not occur as proximate in time to the assessment date at issue of January 1, 2016 as did the comparable sales in the record. In addition, there was no evidence presented by the appellant that the sale transaction had any of the elements of an arm's length transaction as there was no indication if the property sold between related parties; there was no indication whether the property was advertised or exposed on the open market prior to the sale; and/or there was no evidence whether the transaction occurred between a willing seller and a willing buyer.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be the comparable sales submitted by the board of review. Despite that these comparables are smaller in dwelling size when compared to the subject, they are similar to the subject in location, design, age and most features. These properties sold from June 2015 to July 2016 for prices ranging from \$192,000 to \$218,000 or from \$97.94 to \$118.70 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$191,404 or \$84.10 per square foot of living area, including land, which is below the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparable sales for differences when compared to the subject, such as dwelling size, the Board finds the estimated market value as reflected by the assessment is supported and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

said office.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Chi ZZ. Fee	airman
Member	Member
assert Stoffen	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING: <u>CERTIFIC</u>	<u> </u>
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in	complete Final Administrative Decision of the

### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Date:

September 17, 2019

Mano Illorios

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

## PARTIES OF RECORD

### **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

### **APPELLANT**

American Homes 4 Rent TRS, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Ryan Law LLP 311 South Wacker Drive Mailbox #29 Chicago, IL 60606

### **COUNTY**

Will County Board of Review Will County Office Building 302 N. Chicago Street Joliet, IL 60432