

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R)
DOCKET NO .:	16-00210.001-R-1
PARCEL NO .:	03-24-327-005

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd., in Oak Lawn; and the Boone County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>*No Change*</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Boone** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$ 8,333
IMPR.:	\$38,168
TOTAL:	\$46,501

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Boone County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story frame dwelling that has 2,419 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2006. Features include a partial finished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace, and a 700 square foot garage. The subject has a .4064 of an acre or 17,702-square foot site. The subject property is located in Poplar Grove Township, Boone County.

The appellant submitted evidence before the Property Tax Appeal Board claiming overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of the overvaluation claim, the appellant submitted limited descriptive information for 10 comparable sales that were reported to be located from .10 to .42 of a mile from the subject.¹ The comparables were reported to consist of one-story or two-story

¹ The Board requested the appellant to complete the grid analysis in Section V of the appeal petition. The appellant failed to comply with the Board's request.

dwellings, but the specific story height for each comparable was not disclosed. Ten of the dwellings were built from 1997 to 2003 while the age of one comparable was not disclosed. The comparables have three to five bedrooms and one to three bathrooms. The appellant failed to disclose the comparables' exterior construction, foundation type or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces or garages. The dwellings were reported to range in size from 2,250 to 2,736 square feet of living area and have sites that range in size from 11,204 to 23,958 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from December 2012 to June 2015 for prices ranging from \$55,000 to \$138,500 or from \$22.29 to \$58.59 per square foot of living area including land. The appellant's evidence further revealed the subject property sold in March 2013 for \$165,000 or \$68.21 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$46,501. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$138,602 or \$57.30 per square foot of living area including land when applying the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Boone County of 33.55%.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted property record cards and a grid analysis of four comparable properties located in the same subdivision as the subject. The comparables consist of two-story dwellings of frame exterior construction that were built from 2005 to 2007. Three comparables have unfinished basements and one comparable has a partial finished basement. Other features include central air conditioning, a fireplace and garages that contain 660 or 700 square feet of building area. The dwellings range in size from 2,419 to 3,259 square feet of living area and are situated on sites that contain from .2878 to .6583 of an acre of land area. The comparables sold from April 2014 to October 2015 for prices ranging from \$167,000 to \$179,000 or from \$51.24 to \$74.00 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The record contains 14 comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to the comparables submitted by the appellant. The appellant's attorney failed to provide the comparables' specific story height, exterior construction, foundation type or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces or garages for a comparative analysis, which detracts from the weight of the evidence. The Board gave less weight to comparable #1 submitted by the board of review due to its larger dwelling size when compared to the subject. The Board finds the remaining three comparables submitted by the board of review sold more proximate in time to the subject's assessment date and are most similar to the subject in location, land area, design, age, dwelling size and features. They sold from April 2014 to October 2015 for prices ranging from \$172,500 to \$179,000 or from \$71.01 to \$74.00 per square foot of living area including

land. The evidence further shows the subject property was purchased in March 2013 for \$165,000 or \$68.21 per square foot of living area including land. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$138,602 or \$57.30 per square foot of living area including land, which falls below the range established by the most similar comparables contained in the record and below the subject's March 2013 sale price. Based on this evidence, the Board finds the subject property is under-assessed in relation to the most credible market value evidence contained in this record. Therefore, no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mano Moios

Chairman

Member

Member

Member

Member

DISSENTING:

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

June 19, 2018

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), by attorney: Michael R. Davies Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. 5533 West 109th Street, Unit 219 Oak Lawn, IL 60453

COUNTY

Boone County Board of Review Boone County Assessment Office 1208 Logan Avenue Belvidere, IL 61008