



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R)  
DOCKET NO.: 16-00190.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 05-24-327-002

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), the appellant, by Michael R. Davies, of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. in Oak Lawn; and the Boone County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Boone** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$6,733  
**IMPR.:** \$49,274  
**TOTAL:** \$56,007

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Boone County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of vinyl siding exterior construction with 2,547 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2005. Features of the home include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace, and a 740-square foot garage. The property has a 12,480 square foot site and is located in Belvidere Township, Boone County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted limited information on twelve comparable sales, one of which, however, is the subject property. The Board requested that the appellant complete the grid analysis in Section V of the appeal petition. The appellant failed to comply with the Board's request and failed to disclose the comparables' exterior construction, design, foundation type or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces and/or garages. As reported in the appellant's limited grid

analysis, the comparables sold from February 2013 to August 2015 for prices ranging from \$105,000 to \$165,100 or from \$42.50 to \$75.10 per square foot of living area, land included.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested an assessment reflecting a market value of approximately \$137,808 or \$54.11 per square foot of living area, land included, based on the 2016 three-year statutory level of assessment for Boone County.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$56,007. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$166,936 or \$65.54 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Boone County of 33.55% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted Property Record Cards for five comparable sales all located in the same subdivision as the subject. Three of these comparables were also submitted by the appellant. The comparables are two-story dwellings of vinyl siding exterior construction built in 2005 or 2006. The dwellings range in size from 2,420 to 2,666 square feet of living area and are situated on sites containing from 10,106 to 12,240 square feet of land area. The comparables have full unfinished basements; central air conditioning; a fireplace; and an attached garage ranging in size from 640 to 780 square feet of building area. The comparables sold from December 2013 to October 2015 for prices ranging from \$150,000 to \$180,000 or from \$56.26 to \$74.38 per square foot of living area, including land.

In response to the appellant's evidence, the board of review also provided evidence that one of appellant's comparables was a ranch-style home, dissimilar to the subject, eight of appellant's comparables sales were foreclosure transactions, and that the subject last sold in May 2013 for \$140,500 as a foreclosure transaction. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The record contains 13 comparable sales for the Board's consideration, as one of appellant's comparables was the subject property and three of appellant's comparables were also submitted by the board of review who provided information as to the features of those three comparables. The Board gave less weight to the comparables submitted solely by the appellant as the appellant's attorney failed to provide any specifics regarding the comparables' story height, design, exterior construction, foundation type or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces and/or garages for a comparative analysis, which further detracts from the weight of the evidence. Further, seven of the appellant's comparables, including board of review

comparable #2 which was used by both parties, and board of review comparable #5 sold in 2013 and 2014 and are dated and less indicative of market value as of the subject's January 1, 2016 assessment date.

The Board finds that appellant's comparable #4/board of review comparable #1, appellant's comparable 5/board of review comparable #4, and board of review comparable #3 sold more proximate in time to the subject's assessment date and are similar to the subject in location, land area, design, age, dwelling size and features. They sold from January to October 2015 for prices ranging from \$150,000 to \$180,000 or from \$56.26 to \$74.38 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$166,936 or \$65.54 per square foot of living area, including land, which is within the range established by the most similar comparable sales in this record. Based on this evidence, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member

Member

Member

DISSENTING: \_\_\_\_\_

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: November 20, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois  
Property Tax Appeal Board  
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402  
401 South Spring Street  
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), by attorney:  
Michael R. Davies  
Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd.  
5533 West 109th Street, Unit 219  
Oak Lawn, IL 60453

COUNTY

Boone County Board of Review  
Boone County Assessment Office  
1208 Logan Avenue  
Belvidere, IL 61008