

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R)
DOCKET NO .:	16-00188.001-R-1
PARCEL NO .:	05-11-279-005

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd., in Oak Lawn; and the Boone County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>No Change</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Boone** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$ 6,733
IMPR.:	\$37,778
TOTAL:	\$44,511

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Boone County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame exterior construction that contains 2,121 square feet of living area. The dwelling was built in 2004. Features include a partial unfinished basement, central air conditioning and an attached garage that contains 399 square feet of building area. The subject has a 11,961-square foot site. The subject property is located in Belvidere Township, Boone County.

The appellant submitted evidence before the Property Tax Appeal Board claiming overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of the overvaluation claim, the appellant submitted limited descriptive information for seven comparable properties that were located from .10 to .34 of a mile from the subject.<sup>1</sup> The comparables were reported to consist of one-story or two-story

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Board requested the appellant to complete the grid analysis in Section V of the appeal petition. The appellant failed to comply with the Board's request.

dwellings that were built from 1965 to 2005. The dwellings range in size from 1,901 to 2,380 square feet of living area and have sites that range in size from 10,498 to 39,204 square feet of land area. The comparables have three or four bedrooms and two or three bathrooms. The appellant failed to disclose the comparables' exterior construction, foundation type or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces or a garage. The comparables sold from October 2012 to October 2015 for prices ranging from \$100,201 to \$132,000 or from \$47.06 to \$69.04 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$44,511. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$132,671 or \$62.55 per square foot of living area including land when applying the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Boone County of 33.55%.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted a brief addressing the appeal and a detailed grid analysis of the appellant's seven comparable sales and one additional comparable sale. The additional comparable consists of a two-story dwelling of frame exterior construction that contains 2,042 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2004. Features include a partial unfinished basement, central air conditioning and an attached garage that contains 380 square feet of building area. The comparable has a 11,914-square foot site. The comparable sold in August 2015 for \$137,000 or \$67.09 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The record contains eight comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to five of the comparables submitted by the appellant. Two comparables are dissimilar one-story dwellings and one comparable is considerably older in age when compared to the subject. Three comparables sold in 2012 or 2013, which are dated and less reliable indicators of market value as of the subject's January 1, 2016 assessment date. The Board finds the remining three comparables are more similar when compared to the subject in location, land area, design, age, dwelling size and features. They sold from January to October 2015 for prices ranging from \$112,000 to \$137,000 or from \$47.06 to \$67.09 per square foot of living area including land. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$132,671 or \$62.55 per square foot of living area including land, which falls within the range established by the most similar comparable sales contained in the record. Based on this analysis, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is supported. Therefore, no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mano Moios

Chairman

Member

Member

Member

Member

**DISSENTING:** 

### CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

June 19, 2018

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

### AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

### APPELLANT

American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), by attorney: Michael R. Davies Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. 5533 West 109th Street, Unit 219 Oak Lawn, IL 60453

### COUNTY

Boone County Board of Review Boone County Assessment Office 1208 Logan Avenue Belvidere, IL 61008