



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R)  
DOCKET NO.: 16-00166.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 05-36-326-036

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), the appellant, by attorney Michael R. Davies of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd., in Oak Lawn; and the Boone County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Boone** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$ 5,815  
**IMPR.:** \$41,617  
**TOTAL:** \$47,432

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Boone County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2016 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame construction that has 2,220 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 2004. Features include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a 483-square foot attached garage. The subject has a 7,735 square foot site. The subject property is located in Belvidere Township, Boone County, Illinois.

The appellant submitted evidence before the Property Tax Appeal Board claiming overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of the overvaluation claim, the appellant submitted limited descriptive information for 15 comparable properties that were located from .20 to .51 of a mile from the subject.<sup>1</sup> However, comparable #1 was the sale of the subject property in October

---

<sup>1</sup> The Board requested the appellant to complete the grid analysis in Section V of the appeal petition. The appellant failed to comply with the Board's request.

2012. The remaining 14 comparables were reported to consist of one-story or two-story dwellings, but the specific story height for each comparable was not disclosed. The dwellings were built from 1890 to 1987. The comparables have two to six bedrooms and one to three bathrooms. The appellant failed to disclose the comparables' exterior construction, foundation type or features such as central air conditioning, fireplaces or garages. The dwellings range in size from 1,905 to 2,490 square feet of living area and have sites that range in size from 6,098 to 22,651 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from February 2013 to December 2015 for prices ranging from \$42,000 to \$125,000 or from \$22.05 to \$59.80 per square foot of living area including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$47,432. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$141,377 or \$63.68 per square foot of living area including land when applying the 2016 three-year average median level of assessment for Boone County of 33.55%.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted a letter addressing the appeal and a detailed grid analysis of three comparable sales. One comparable is located "two doors down" along the same street as the subject and two comparables are located within a mile of the subject. The comparables consist of two-story dwellings of frame or brick and frame construction that were built in 1995 or 2005. Features include unfinished basements, central air conditioning and attached garages that range in size from 468 to 792 square feet of building area. The dwellings range in size from 1,942 to 2,006 square feet of living area and are situated on sites that contain from 7,735 to 14,616 square feet of land area. The comparables sold from July 2013 to December 2015 for prices of \$145,000 or \$155,000 or from \$74.67 to \$79.32 per square foot of living area including land.

With respect to the appellant's evidence, the board of review argued the appellant submitted insufficient evidence. The board of review argued the comparables are older than the subject and one comparable is a dissimilar tri-level home. In addition, one comparable was not advertised for sale as depicted on the Real Estate Transfer Declaration submitted. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The record contains 17 comparable sales for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to the comparables submitted by the appellant. Notwithstanding the lack of descriptive information of the comparables in terms of design, exterior construction and features, all the comparables submitted by the appellant are considerably older in age when compared to the subject. Additionally, seven of the comparables sold 2013, which are dated and less reliable

indicators of market value in relation to the subject's January 1, 2016 assessment date. Similarly, the Board gave less weight to comparable #3 submitted by the board of review due to its 2013 sale date. The Board finds the remaining two comparables submitted by the board of review are more similar when compared to the subject in location, land area, design, exterior construction, age, dwelling size and features. They sold in December 2014 and December 2015 for prices of \$145,000 and \$155,000 or \$74.67 and \$77.27 per square foot of living area including land. The subject's assessment reflects an estimated market value of \$141,377 or \$63.68 per square foot of living area including land, which is less than the most similar comparable sales contained in the record. Based on this record, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value as reflected by its assessment is supported. Therefore, no reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: \_\_\_\_\_

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

May 15, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois  
Property Tax Appeal Board  
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402  
401 South Spring Street  
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

American Homes 4 Rent (AH4R), by attorney:  
Michael R. Davies  
Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd.  
5533 West 109th Street, Unit 219  
Oak Lawn, IL 60453

COUNTY

Boone County Board of Review  
Boone County Assessment Office  
1208 Logan Avenue  
Belvidere, IL 61008