



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Manor Properties LLC
DOCKET NO.: 15-37629.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 13-01-217-030-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Manor Properties LLC, the appellant, by attorney David C. Dunkin of Arnstein & Lehr, LLP in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **A Reduction** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$6,600
IMPR.: \$23,700
TOTAL: \$30,300

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a three-story, multi-family dwelling of masonry construction. The dwelling is approximately 87 years old and has 5,670 square feet of living area. Features of the dwelling include four apartment units, a full unfinished basement and a two and one-half car garage. The property has a 4,125 square foot site and is located in Chicago, Jefferson Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on April 22, 2015, for a price of \$303,000 or \$75,750 per apartment unit or \$53.49 per square foot of living area, land included. In Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the residential appeal form, the appellant stated the parties to the transaction were not related; the property was sold by a realtor; and the property

had been advertised for sale with the multiple listing service. The appellant did not answer the question that asked how long the subject had been exposed to the market. To document the transaction, the appellant submitted a copy of the settlement statement.¹ The settlement statement revealed that commissions had been paid to two realty firms. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$50,599. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$498,022 or \$124,505.50 per apartment unit or \$87.73 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2015 three-year average median level of assessment for class 2 property of 10.16% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales that sold from June 2014 to November 2015 for prices that ranged from \$475,000 to \$975,000 or from \$84.90 to \$165.14 per square foot of living area, land included. The comparables have the same assigned neighborhood and classification codes as the subject. Their sites have either 4,092 or 6,724 square feet of land area. The comparables are improved with two or three-story, multi-family dwellings of masonry construction. The dwellings are either 67 or 87 years old and contain from 4,562 to 5,904 square feet of living area. The comparables have full basements and garages, and one comparable has three fireplaces. The board of review did not provide information on the number of apartment units. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in on April 22, 2015, for a price of \$303,000 or \$53.49 per square foot of living area, land included. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had some of the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the residential appeal form disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a realtor, and the property had been advertised on the open market with the multiple listing service. The Board finds the purchase price is below the market value reflected by the assessment. The Board finds the board of review did not present any evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction and was not able to refute the appellant's contention that the purchase price was reflective of market value. The board of review presented four comparable sales that sold from June 2014 to November 2015 for prices that ranged from

¹ The appellant submitted an MLS data sheet for another property that was the subject matter of a different appeal filed with the Property Tax Appeal Board (15-37604, Kim Conlon, appellant).

\$475,000 to \$975,000 or from \$84.90 to \$165.14 per square foot of living area, land included. The Board finds that three of these sale dates were not as proximate to the assessment date as the April 2015 sale of the subject property. Although the board of review presented four apartment buildings as comparable properties, the board of review did not provide information regarding the number of apartment units per dwelling. This lack of information undermines the board of review's claim that these comparables are similar to the subject property. The Board finds that a reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellant's request is appropriate.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: May 15, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Manor Properties LLC, by attorney:
David C. Dunkin
Arnstein & Lehr, LLP
161 North Clark
Suite 4200
Chicago, IL 60601

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602