

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: David Coleman
DOCKET NO.: 15-34965.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 14-32-218-041-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are David Coleman, the appellant(s), by attorney John P. Brady, of Thomas M. Tully & Associates in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$ 24,750 **IMPR.:** \$ 79,992 **TOTAL:** \$ 104,742

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board (the "Board") finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

# **Findings of Fact**

The subject consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry construction with 1,760 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 137 years old. Features of the home include a full basement with a formal recreation room, central air conditioning, and a fireplace. The property has a 2,750 square foot site, and is located in Chicago, North Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-10 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. The subject is owned by a business entity, and, therefore, it is not owner occupied.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted information on nine equity comparables.

The appellant also contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on October 19, 2011 for a price of \$765,000. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested that the subject's assessment be reduced to 10.00% of the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$104,742. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$79,992, or \$45.45 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,047,420, or \$595.13 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2015 statutory level of assessment for class 2 property of 10.00% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on five equity comparables, and four sale comparables.<sup>1</sup>

At hearing, both parties reaffirmed the evidence previously submitted.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that the sale of the subject in October 2011 for \$765,000 is too remote in time to accurately reflect the subject's market value as of January 1, 2015, the lien date in this appeal. 35 ILCS 200/9-155. Thus, this sale was given no weight in the Board's analysis. Therefore, the Board finds that the appellant has not proven, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the subject is overvalued.

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Board notes that the board of review submitted two grid sheets with nearly identical information. On both grid sheets, comparables #2, #3, and #4 are identical. On the first grid sheet, comparable #1 has the PIN ending in -044, and on the second grid sheet, comparable #1 has the PIN ending in -050. For ease of reference, comparable #1 on the first grid sheet will be referred to "board of review comparable #1," while comparable #1 on the second grid sheet will be referred to as "board of review comparable #5."

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be appellant comparables #6 and #7, and board of review comparables #1, #2, and #3. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$37.91 to \$56.17 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment of \$45.45 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed, and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

	Chairman
21. Fe-	a R
Member	Member
Sobort Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Member
DISSENTING:CERTI	FICATION
CLKII	1101111011

# As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do

hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	te: August 20, 2019	
	Maus Illorios	
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board	

#### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

# PARTIES OF RECORD

# **AGENCY**

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

# **APPELLANT**

David Coleman, by attorney: John P. Brady Thomas M. Tully & Associates 33 North Dearborn Street Suite 2450 Chicago, IL 60602

# **COUNTY**

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602