



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Perdro C Zambrano
DOCKET NO.: 15-34217.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 16-02-314-023-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Perdro C Zambrano, the appellant(s), by attorney Brandon Eichhorn, Attorney at Law in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds No Change in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 3,675
IMPR.: \$13,009
TOTAL: \$16,684

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame construction with 2,354 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 99 years old. The property has a 3,500 square foot site and is located in West Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased pursuant to a foreclosure on July 22, 2013 for a price of \$25,000, or \$10.62 per square foot, including land. The property was sold using a Realtor and the parties to the transaction were unrelated. The property was listed on the market for 40 days as REO/Lender Owned.. The appellant's evidence included a printout from the Multiple Listing Service. The appellant also submitted information on eight suggested

comparable sales and a chart reflecting adjustment information. The appellant requested an assessment reduction to \$2,500 for the 2015 tax year.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$16,684. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$166,840 or \$70.88 per square foot, including land, when applying the 10% level of assessment as determined by the Cook County Real Property Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables, all of which reflected sale data. Three of the comparables were located within two blocks from the subject property. They sold from October 2012 to April 2015 for sale prices ranging from \$26.04 to \$127.44 per square foot, including land. The Board notes that the board of review's comparable #1 is identical to the appellant's comparable #1.

In written rebuttal, the appellant argued that board of review's comparables were not similar to the subject for various reasons. The appellant also requested that the Board use the median sale price per square foot of the best comparables in the record in determining whether the subject is overvalued.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that the sale of the subject in July 2013 for \$25,000 was a "compulsory sale" through the documentation submitted by the parties. A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

- (i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

Additionally, real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Bd. of Educ. of Meridian Cmty. Unit Sch. Dist. No. 223 v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 2011 IL App (2d) 100068, ¶ 36 (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, when there is a recent sale of the subject, and that sale is a foreclosure, the Board may consider evidence which would show whether the sale price was representative of the subject's fair cash value. See 35 ILCS 200/16-183 ("The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer."). Such evidence can include the descriptive and sales information for recently sold properties that are similar to the subject. See Id.

The Board rejects the appellant's argument that the Board should use the median sale price per square foot of the best comparables in the record in ascertaining whether the subject is overvalued as this argument was only raised during rebuttal, and, therefore, the board of review was not granted an opportunity to challenge this argument. As such, this argument was not made timely. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.66(c) ("Rebuttal evidence shall not consist of new evidence such as an appraisal or newly discovered comparable properties. A party to the appeal shall be precluded from submitting its own case in chief in the guise of rebuttal evidence.").

The Board finds the best comparables to be the appellant's comparable(s) #1 through #8, as well as the board of review's comparable(s) #1 and #3. These comparables sold for prices ranging from \$10.52 to \$127.44 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$70.88 per square foot of living area including land, which is within the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. After considering all the evidence and various relevant factors, the Board finds that the subject is not overvalued and that a reduction in assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member

Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: June 19, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Perdro C Zambrano, by attorney:
Brandon Eichhorn
Attorney at Law
2657 West Ainslie Street
2nd Floor
Chicago, IL 60625

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602