

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Chadi Nouneh
DOCKET NO.: 15-32865.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 17-22-302-074-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Chadi Nouneh, the appellant, by attorney Timothy E. Moran, of Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$10,450 **IMPR.:** \$67,638 **TOTAL:** \$78,088

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a three-story townhome of masonry exterior construction with 2,598 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 8 years old. Features of the home include a slab foundation, central air conditioning and a two-car garage. The property has a 1,100 square foot site and is located in Chicago, South Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-95 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. The subject's land assessment was not contested. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on five equity comparables located within the same neighborhood code as the subject property.¹

¹ In the appellant's Comparable Sales/Assessment Grid Analysis the same property, identified as PIN 17-22-315-042-0000, was presented for both comparable #4 and #5, and a different property, identified as PIN 17-22-315-041-0000, was presented for comparable #5 in the appellant's "Basis of Brief" property detailed listing. The PIN 17-22-315-041-0000 as reported in the "Basis of Brief" evidence for comparable #5 was included in the appellant's appeal with an improvement assessment of \$52,886 or \$20.90 per square foot of living area and a total assessment of \$65,502.

The comparables were improved with three-story townhomes of masonry exterior construction. The dwellings are 9 or 13 years old. The comparables have similar features when compared to the subject property. The dwellings contain either 2,530 or 2,625 square feet of living area and have improvement assessments ranging from \$45,195 to \$52,886 or from \$17.86 to \$20.90 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested that the improvement assessment be reduced to \$51,536 or \$19.84 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$78,088. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$67,638 or \$26.03 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables located in the same neighborhood code, same block, same street and/or a .25 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables were improved with three-story townhomes of masonry or frame and masonry exterior construction that contain either 2,220 or 2,598 square feet of living area. The dwellings are 8 or 10 years old. The comparables have identical features when compared to the subject property. The comparables had improvement assessments ranging from \$63,381 to \$67,961 or from \$26.03 to \$29.92 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested that the assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

Both parties submitted nine comparables for the Board's consideration all of which are similar to the subject property, with two of the board of review comparables being identical in property characteristics to the subject.

The Board gave greater weight and finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the board of review's comparables #1 and #2 because they are located within the same neighborhood code, same block and/or street as the subject property. In addition, these comparables are identical to the subject in design, exterior construction, age, dwelling size, foundation and features. These comparables had improvement assessments of \$67,619 and \$67,961 or \$26.03 and \$26.16 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$67,638 or \$26.03 per square foot of building area is between the two best comparables contained in this record and appears to be well supported by these comparables. Based on this record, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mauro Minios Chairman Member Member Member Member DISSENTING:

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

> May 15, 2018 Date: Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of

the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Chadi Nouneh, by attorney:
Timothy E. Moran
Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd.
111 West Washington Street
Suite 1300
Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602