



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Jinaqi Wei
DOCKET NO.: 15-30612.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 31-26-313-033-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Jinaqi Wei, the appellant(s), by attorney Jessica Hill-Magiera, Attorney at Law in Lake Zurich; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds A Reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$1,360
IMPR.: \$740
TOTAL: \$2,100

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 43 year old, two-story, townhome dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 1,224 square feet of living area. The property has a 1,512 square foot site and is located in Richton Park, Rich Township, Cook County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence showing that the subject sold on September 16, 2013 for \$21,000. This evidence included a copy multiple-listing database printout (MLS). The MLS printout stated that the subject was a REO/lender owned, pre-foreclosure property. The appellant's pleadings regarding Section IV- Recent Sale Data confirmed: the closing date; sale price; the parties to the transaction were not related; and that the subject was advertised for sale on the open market with a realtor. The appellant also submitted eight sale comparables and adjustment

information in a grid entitled, "Property Equalization Values." Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$5,658. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$56,580 or \$46.22 per square foot of building area, including land, when applying the 2015 level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 10%. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on eight equity comparables.

In rebuttal, the appellant argued that the board did not respond or object to the appellant's sale comparables. The appellant's rebuttal evidence included sale data for each of the board of review's equity comparables. The appellant also distinguished the board of review's comparables based on sale date. The appellant reaffirmed the request for an assessment reduction.

At hearing, the board of review objected to the appellant's "Property Equalization Values" grid on the grounds that it was inadmissible hearsay evidence without the person who prepared that grid present at hearing and subject to cross-examination under oath. The Board sustained the objection but held that it may consider the appellant's raw, unadjusted sale data. The appellant confirmed the subject sold pursuant to a foreclosure in September 2013 and was listed for 77 days on the MLS. The appellant and the board of review analyst reviewed and rested on the evidence previously submitted.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c).

In addressing the appellant's market value argument, the Board finds that the sale of the subject in September 2013 for \$21,000 or \$17.16 per square feet of living area is a "compulsory sale." The testimony and evidence including MLS printout disclosed the subject was a foreclosure sale. A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

- (i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and
- (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Board of Educ. of Meridian Community Unit School Dist. No. 223 v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 961 N.E.2d 794, 802, 356 Ill.Dec. 405, 413 (2d Dist. 2011) citing Chrysler Corp. v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211 387 N.E.2d 351 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, the Illinois General Assembly recently provided very clear guidance for the Board with regards to compulsory sales. Section 16-183 of the Illinois Property Tax Code states as follows:

The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of the comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer.

35 ILCS 200/16-183. Therefore, the Board is statutorily required to consider the compulsory sale of comparable properties submitted by the parties to revise and/or correct the subject's assessment.

The evidence submitted disclosed the subject's sale was a compulsory sale. In determining the fair market value of the subject property, the Board looks to the evidence presented by the parties. The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in September 2013 for \$21,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction including disclosing that the parties to the transaction were not related, that the property was sold using a realtor, and that it was advertised for sale on the open market with a listing on the MLS for 77 days. In further support of the transaction, the appellant submitted copies of the settlement statement, listing sheet, and property history report.

Based on this record, the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$21,000 as of January 1, 2015. Since market value has been determined, the level of assessment for class 2-95 residential property of 10% shall apply as determined by the Cook County Classification Code.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

April 17, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Jinaqi Wei, by attorney:
Jessica Hill-Magiera
Attorney at Law
790 Harvest Drive
Lake Zurich, IL 60047

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602