



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Robert & Sharon Naclerio  
DOCKET NO.: 15-30118.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 20-11-115-014-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Robert & Sharon Naclerio, the appellants, by attorney Joanne Elliott, of Elliott & Associates, P.C. in Des Plaines; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **A Reduction** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$29,766  
**IMPR.:** \$75,234  
**TOTAL:** \$105,000

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellants timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of masonry construction with 5,000 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 108 years old. Features of the home include a partially finished basement and two fireplaces. The property has a 9,020 square foot site and is located in Chicago, Hyde Park Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-09 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellants contend overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted a retrospective appraisal estimating the subject property had a market value of \$1,050,000 as of January 1, 2015. The appellant's appraisal utilized the sales comparison approach in estimating a market value for the subject property. The appellant's appraisers selected five comparable properties which were three-story or two-story dwellings that ranged in size from 4,000 to 6,568 square feet of living area. The comparables had other features with

varying degrees of similarity to the subject. The comparables had sale dates ranging from May 2014 to August 2015 for prices ranging from \$854,000 to \$1,125,000 or from \$171.29 to \$213.50 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellants requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$124,166. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,241,660 or \$248.33 per square foot of living area, including land when using the level of assessments for class 2 property of 10% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted a grid analysis containing information on four sales. The comparables were three-story dwellings of masonry construction that ranged in size from 5,024 to 9,531 square feet of living area. The comparables had other features with varying degrees of similarity to the subject. The sales occurred from August 2013 to January 2015 for prices ranging from \$1,715,392 to \$2,625,000 or from \$275.42 to \$462.78 per square foot of living area, including land.

As part of the appellants' rebuttal, the appellant requested that the subject's 2015 assessment not exceed \$118,516, which is the amount the board of review reduced the subject's assessment to for 2016.

### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellants contend the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellants met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appraisal submitted by the appellants estimating the subject property had a market value of \$1,050,000 as of January 1, 2015. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,241,660 or \$248.33 per square foot of living area, including land, which is above the appraised value. The Board gave less weight to the sale comparables submitted by the board of review, as three of the sales occurred greater than 13 months prior to the January 1, 2015 assessment date. The Board further finds that the remaining unadjusted sale does not overcome the weight of the appellants' appraisal. Based on this evidence the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellants' request is justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(d) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(d)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: \_\_\_\_\_

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: October 16, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois  
Property Tax Appeal Board  
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402  
401 South Spring Street  
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Robert & Sharon Naclerio, by attorney:  
Joanne Elliott  
Elliott & Associates, P.C.  
1430 Lee Street  
Des Plaines, IL 60018

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review  
County Building, Room 601  
118 North Clark Street  
Chicago, IL 60602