



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Geary Depue
DOCKET NO.: 15-29083.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 30-18-130-016-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Geary Depue, the appellant; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$2,041
IMPR.: \$3,842
TOTAL: \$5,883

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 66-year-old, 1.5-story dwelling of frame construction with 1,423 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a partial basement, central air conditioning, and a three-car garage. The property has a 7,425 square foot site and is located in Thornton Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on July 16, 2012 for a price of \$15,000 or \$10.54 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price. The appellant also included a 2013 decision for the subject sale in which the subject's sale was not disputed by the board of review.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$5,883. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$58,830 or \$41.34 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2015 level of assessments for class 2 property of 10% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four suggested equity comparables with sales data on each property. Those properties range: in age from 56 to 74 years of age; in size from 1,243 to 1,757 square feet of living area; in sale date from July, 2013 to August, 2015; and in sale price from \$50.82 to \$112.63 per square foot of living area. In addition, the board of review submitted a brief arguing that the subject's 2012 sale was compulsory and therefore not at market value. In support of this argument, the board of review submitted a deed trail for the subject property.

In written rebuttal, the appellant distinguished the board of review's suggested comparables based on location and size. In addition, the appellant argued that board of review's comparable #3 was almost completely rebuilt after a truck crashed into the house. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted a printout of an online article about a truck crashing into a house in Calumet City.

At hearing, the appellant reiterated his market value argument and testified that the subject property is tenant-occupied. The appellant also testified that he submitted an appraisal and a 2014 Board decision but could not produce any evidence of submission of said documents. The board of review argued the assessment should be upheld based on the four suggested comparable sales that they submitted.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

In determining the fair market value of the subject property, the Board looks to the evidence presented by the parties. Based on the deed trail, the appellant's recent sale is found to be a compulsory sale.

A "compulsory sale" is defined as

- (i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and
- (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Board of Educ. of Meridian Community Unit School Dist. No. 223 v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 961 N.E.2d 794, 802, 356 Ill.Dec. 405, 413 (2d Dist. 2011) (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211, 387 N.E.2d 351 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, the Illinois General Assembly recently provided very clear guidance for the Board with regards to compulsory sales. Section 16-183 of the Illinois Property Tax Code states as follows:

The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer.

35 ILCS 200/16-183. Therefore, the Board is statutorily required to consider the compulsory sales of comparable properties which were submitted by the parties. In considering the compulsory sale of the subject property, the Board looks to both the appellant's evidence and the board of review's comparables. The Board finds that the appellant failed to submit any comparable sales and the board of review submitted four relevant sales. The Board finds that the subject's 2012 sale of \$15,000 falls substantially below the sales comparables in the record. Therefore, the Board finds the subject's 2012 sale is not reflective of the market value. Conversely, the subject's assessment at \$58,830 reflects a market value of \$41.34 per square foot of living area, which is only slightly below the range of the comparables. Based on this evidence, the Board finds that the appellant did not meet its burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(b) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(b)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Acting Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: January 16, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Geary Depue
247 Ruth St.
Calumet City, IL 60409

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602