



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: John & Gai Moodie
DOCKET NO.: 15-06122.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 08-20-416-027

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are John & Gai Moodie, the appellants, by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the DuPage County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **DuPage** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$50,610
IMPR.: \$138,660
TOTAL: \$189,270

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the DuPage County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a part two-story and part one-story dwelling of frame exterior construction with 4,072 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1987. Features of the home include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a 769 square foot garage. The property has a 14,218 square foot site and is located in Naperville, Lisle Township, DuPage County.

The appellants contend assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. The subject's land assessment was not contested. In support of this argument the appellants submitted information on three equity comparables located in the same neighborhood code and from .13 to .19 of a mile from the subject property.¹ The comparables were improved with part two-story and part one-

¹ Due to greater details in characteristics, the data is drawn from the board of review reiteration of the appellant's comparables.

story style frame dwellings that ranged in size from 3,254 to 4,392 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed in 1985 or 1988. Features include an unfinished basement, central air conditioning, one or two fireplaces and a garage ranging in size from 560 to 816 square feet of building area. The comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$94,630 to \$126,310 or from \$28.76 to \$29.29 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellants requested that the improvement assessment be reduced to \$118,264 or \$29.04 per square foot of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$189,270. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$138,660 or \$34.05 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on three equity comparables located in the same neighborhood code and from .04 to .07 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables were improved with part two-story and part one-story style brick or frame dwellings that range in size from 3,976 to 4,144 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed in 1985 or 1986. Features include a basement with two comparables having a finished area, central air conditioning, one fireplace and a garage ranging in size from 624 to 707 square feet of building area. The comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$138,240 to \$154,950 or from \$34.73 to \$37.39 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested that the assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayers contend assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellants did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted six suggested comparables for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to the appellants' comparable #3 based on its smaller dwelling size when compared to the subject. The Board gave less weight to the board of review comparables #1 and #2 based on their finished basement and/or has a brick exterior construction when compared to the subject's unfinished basement and frame exterior construction.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellants' comparables #1 and #2 along with the board of review comparable #3. These comparables are more similar in location, dwelling size, design, exterior construction, age and features when compared to the subject property. Furthermore, these comparables each have an unfinished basement like the subject. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$157,100 to \$195,770 or from \$28.76 to \$36.51 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$189,270 or \$34.05 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record the Board finds the appellants did

not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(b) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(b)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Acting Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: September 22, 2017



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

John & Gai Moodie, by attorney:
Robert Rosenfeld
Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC
33 North Dearborn Street
Suite 1850
Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

DuPage County Board of Review
DuPage Center
421 N. County Farm Road
Wheaton, IL 60187