



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Robert Romanchek
DOCKET NO.: 15-02864.001-R-2 through 15-02864.002-R-2
PARCEL NO.: See Below

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Robert Romanchek, the appellant, by attorney Ronald Kingsley, of Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC in Lake Forest; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

DOCKET NO	PARCEL NUMBER	LAND	IMPRVMT	TOTAL
15-02864.001-R-2	12-30-100-004	267,504	395,724	\$663,228
15-02864.002-R-2	12-30-100-005	41,814	0	\$41,814

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2015 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 2.25-story brick and frame dwelling containing 6,629 square feet of living area¹. The dwelling was constructed in 1930 and features a basement with finished area, central air conditioning and 4 fireplaces. The subject also features a 3-car garage, a 1-car garage, a carport and a barn with finished area². The subject includes two parcels: 12-30-100-004 which contains 4.37 acres of land plus the dwelling and 12-30-100-005 which contains 1.5

¹ The appellant, in the appraisal, reports the dwelling contains 7,117 square feet of living area and submitted a schematic diagram and photographic evidence to support the claim. The board of review reported the dwelling contains 6,629 square feet of living area and reports the 3rd floor/attic is not fully finished. In this analysis, the Board will use the dwelling size of 6,629 square feet of living area.

² Per appraiser's photographic evidence. Although the barn, according to the property record card, contains finished area, it has no plumbing and is not included in the square footage of living area reported by the county on the grid analysis.

acres of land with no improvements, for a total site size of 5.87 acres (255,697 square feet of land area.) The property is located in Lake Forest, Shields Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted an appraisal prepared by Richard McNamara estimating the subject property, including both parcels, had a market value of \$1,800,000 or \$271.53 per square foot of living area as of October 24, 2014 using the dwelling size of 6,629 square feet of living area. The appraiser analyzed seven comparables, four sales and three active listings. The sales occurred from October 2013 through July 2014 for prices ranging from \$1,575,000 to \$2,230,000 or from \$189.46 to \$356.82 per square foot of living area including land. The listings had asking prices ranging from \$1,900,000 to \$2,650,000 or from \$252.19 to \$437.90 per square foot of living area including land. The comparables are described as 2-story dwellings³ ranging in age from 52 to 104 years of age. They range in size from 4,414 to 9,105 square feet of living area and are located a distance of .59 to 9.48 miles from the subject. They feature basements, three with finished areas, one to four fireplaces, and two to four car garages. Six of the comparables feature central air conditioning. After adjusting for differences with the subject including listing versus sale, site size, view, dwelling size, features and other dissimilarities, the comparables' adjusted sale/asking prices ranged from \$1,750,500 to \$2,538,000. The appraiser did not develop the cost approach but did estimate the value of the site, including both parcels, to be \$800,000 for 5.86 acres.

Based on this evidence, the appellant requested the total assessment be reduced to \$599,940 or a market value of approximately \$1,800,000 or \$271.53 per square foot of living area including land at the statutory level of assessment using the dwelling size of 6,629 square feet of living area.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject property, including both parcels, of \$705,042. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$2,124,900 or \$320.55 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2015 three-year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 33.18% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

With respect to the appellant's evidence, the board of review cites differences between the subject and the appraiser's comparables in dwelling sizes and features. The board of review also cites differences between the appraiser's comparables and the public record in dwelling sizes. The board of review takes issue with the appraiser's land adjustments which range from \$.19 to \$1.41 per square feet of land area.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted information on six comparable sales. These comparables are described as 1.75 or 2-story brick or frame dwellings built between 1910 and 1959. They range in size from 4,862 to 8,107 square feet of living area and are located from .11 to 2.95 miles from the subject. The comparables feature basements, one with finished area, central air conditioning and two to five fireplaces. Five of the comparables feature garages. These comparables sold from March 2011 through November 2015 for prices ranging from \$2,225,000 to \$3,315,000 or from \$353.90 to \$484.81 per square foot of living area

³ Based on photographic evidence in the appraisal.

including land. The board of review comparable #1 is the same property as appellant's comparable #6. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In rebuttal, the appellant takes issue with the board of review's description of the subject's barn as a "guest house" given there is no plumbing in the building. The appellant also points out that board of review comparable #1 is reported as containing 4,862 square feet of living area in the board of review's grid analysis, but is shown on the assessor's web site as having 6,936 square feet of living area.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

Initially, the Board finds the size of the subject dwelling to be 6,629 square feet of living area. After reviewing the property record card, the photographic evidence and schematic submitted by the appellant's appraiser, and the MLS Listing sheet, the Board finds the 3rd floor/attic of the subject contains 1,025 square feet of finished living area. The Board further finds that board of review comparable #1 (also appellant's comparable #6) features 6,936 square feet of living area in both the main dwelling and the outbuildings based on the property record cards submitted in evidence by the board of review.

The appellant submitted an appraisal estimating the property had a market value of \$1,800,000 or \$271.53 per square foot of living area as of October 24, 2014. The Board gave little weight to the final opinion of value found in the appraisal report based on dissimilarities between the subject and the comparables. Comparables #1 and #2 sold in 2013, not proximate in time to the subject's assessment date of January 1, 2015, and without adjustment therefore. Comparable #2 was significantly larger and comparable #3 was significantly smaller than the subject. Comparable #4 was 9.48 miles from the subject. Comparables #1, #3, #4 and #5 featured significantly smaller sites than the subject. The appraiser valued the 5.86 acre site at \$800,000, or \$3.13 per square foot of land area, but applied adjustments of only \$0.19 to \$0.29 per square foot of land area to five of the seven comparables, adjusted comparable #6 by \$1.41 per square foot of land area, and did not adjust comparable #7 at all. The Board will however consider the raw sales data.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be board of review comparables #1 and #5. These comparables were similar to the subject in style, dwelling size, site size, age, foundation type and most features. They sold in November 2014 and November 2015 for \$2,230,000 and \$2,750,000 or for \$321.51⁴ and \$416.79 per square foot of living area including land, respectively. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$2,124,900 or \$320.55 per square foot of living area, land included, which is below these most similar

⁴ Using the corrected above ground living area size of 6,936 square feet of living area.

comparables on both a total market value basis as well as a per square foot basis. Based on this evidence, the Board finds no reduction in the subject's assessment based on overvaluation is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(b) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(b)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Member



Acting Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: February 20, 2018



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Robert Romanchek, by attorney:
Ronald Kingsley
Lake County Real Estate Tax Appeal, LLC
13975 W. Polo Trail Drive
#201
Lake Forest, IL 60045

COUNTY

Lake County Board of Review
18 North County Street
7th Floor
Waukegan, IL 60085