

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT:	Paper Street Group, LLC
DOCKET NO.:	14-30863.001-R-1
PARCEL NO .:	21-30-321-023-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Paper Street Group, LLC, the appellant(s), by attorney Richard D. Worsek, of Worsek & Vihon in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>*A Reduction*</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$5,208
IMPR.:	\$10,292
TOTAL:	\$15,500

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

### **Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2014 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

### **Findings of Fact**

The subject property is an 86 year-old, three-story multi-family dwelling of masonry construction containing 10,404 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a full unfinished basement and a four-car garage. The property has a 7,440 square foot site and is located in Hyde Park Township, Cook County. The property is a class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted a settlement statement disclosing the subject property was purchased in a short sale on December 13, 2013 for a price of \$155,000. The appellant also submitted a Multiple Listing Service information sheet that disclosed the subject was sold short and subject to bank approval. The appellant submitted a print-out from the Cook County Recorder of Deeds commonly known as a "deed trail" that disclosed: 1) a *lis pendens* and notice of foreclosure had been recorded

against Elahi Anis; 2) the grant of a Warranty Deed from Anis to the appellant; and 3) a release granted to Anis. The appellant also disclosed in Section IV–Recent Sale Data of the Residential Appeal that the subject was not transferred between related parties, and was advertised and sold by a realtor. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$28,617. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$286,170 or \$27.51 per square foot of living area when using the 2014 level of assessment of 10.00% for Class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. The subject's sale price of \$155,000 reflects a market value of \$14.90 per square foot of living area including land. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on three suggested comparable sales.

# **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant has met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

In addressing the appellant's market value argument, the Board finds that the sale of the subject in December 2013 for \$155,000 is a "compulsory sale." A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

(i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Bd. of Educ. of Meridian Cmty. Unit Sch. Dist. No. 223 v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 961 N.E. 2d 794, 802 (2d Dist. 2011) (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd., 69 Ill. App. 3d 207, 211 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, when there was a recent sale of the subject, and that sale was compulsory, the Board may consider evidence which would show whether the sale price was representative of the

subject's fair cash value. The Illinois General Assembly recently provided clear guidance for the Board regarding compulsory sales. Section 16-183 of the Illinois Property Tax Code states as follows:

The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer.

### 35 ILCS 200/16-183.

In determining the fair market value of the subject property, the Board may look to other evidence presented by the parties. Although the appellant's recent sale appears to have been a compulsory sale, it does reflect the fair market value based upon an analysis of recent sales of comparable properties and other evidence. The Board finds the three sale comparables submitted by the board of review comparables are too dissimilar to the subject in various key property characteristics to establish a reliable range of comparable properties. They sold from April 2011 through July 2013, and contained from 2,724 to 8,190 square feet of living area including land. The subject was sold more recently in December 2013 and contained 10,404 square foot of living area, including land, which was much larger than the board of review's sale comparables. After considering all the evidence and various relevant factors, the Board finds that the subject is overvalued and holds that a reduction is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Mano Moios Chairman Acting Member Member Member Acting Member

**DISSENTING:** 

### CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

June 23, 2017

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

### **IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of

the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND</u> <u>EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.