

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Ralph Clinnin
DOCKET NO.: 14-29506.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 30-31-413-027-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Ralph Clinnin, the appellant, by John S. Xydakis, of the Law Offices of John S. Xydakis in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$2,145 **IMPR.:** \$7,423 **TOTAL:** \$9,568

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2014 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a 1.5-story dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 1,753 square feet of living area.¹ The dwelling is 64 years old. Features of the home include a full finished basement and a two-car garage. The property has a 6,600 square foot site and is located in Lansing, Thornton Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-03 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

¹ The appellant reported on their grid analysis that the subject's dwelling is a one-story style dwelling with 1,055 square feet of living area. The board of review reports that the subject's dwelling is a 1.5-story design having 1,753 square feet of living area. Both parties submitted a photograph of the subject property which indicates the subject is a 1.5-story design. The Board finds that the board of review's grid analysis is more reliable and for this analysis will use 1,753 square feet reported by the board of review.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. The subject's land assessment was not contested. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables. The comparables were improved with one-story dwellings of masonry exterior construction. The dwellings are from 54 to 87 years old. One comparable has a basement. The appellant's attorney did not indicate whether any of the comparables had a garage. The dwellings range in size from 1,008 to 1,248 square feet of living area and have improvement assessments ranging from \$3,471 to \$5,350 or from \$2.86 to \$4.31 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested that the improvement assessment be reduced to \$4,505.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$9,568. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$7,423 or \$4.23 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables located in the same neighborhood code and within .25 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables were improved with three, one-story dwellings and one, 1.5-story dwelling of masonry or frame exterior construction that range in size from 1,505 to 1,626 square feet of living area. The dwellings are from 37 or 72 years old. Each comparable has a basement with one comparable having a finished area, one comparable has central air conditioning, one comparable has a fireplace and each comparable has either a 2-car or 2.5-car garage. The comparables have improvement assessments ranging from \$7,759 to \$9,767 or from \$4.88 to \$6.49 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested that the assessment be confirmed.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted eight suggested comparables for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to the appellant's comparables based on their considerably smaller dwelling size when compared to the subject.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the board of review's comparables. These comparables have varying degrees of similarity in location, dwelling size, age, design, exterior construction and features when compared to the subject property. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$7,759 to \$9,767 or from \$4.88 to \$6.49 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$7,423 or \$4.23 per square foot of living area falls below the range established by the comparables in this record. After considering adjustments to the comparables for differences when compared to the subject, the Board finds the subject's improvement assessment is supported. Based on this record the Board

finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(b) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(b)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mauro Illorios	
	Chairman
21. Fe	C. R.
Member	Acting Member
asort Stoffen	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	te: December 19, 2017	
	alportal	
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board	

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Ralph Clinnin, by attorney: John S. Xydakis Law Offices of John S. Xydakis 30 North Michigan Avenue Suite 402 Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602