

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Pangea Equity
DOCKET NO.: 14-22684.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 20-29-413-017-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Pangea Equity, the appellant(s), by attorney Maureen C. Pikarski, of Gordon & Pikarski in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 5,750 **IMPR.:** \$43,147 **TOTAL:** \$48,897

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2014 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story apartment building of masonry construction with 12,050 square feet of living area. It is 96 years old. The property has a 10,000 square foot site and is located in Lake Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 3-14 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased in a foreclosure sale on April 22, 2013 for a price of \$155,000, or \$12.86 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to \$15,500.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$48,897. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of

\$488,970 or \$40.58 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2014 level of assessments for class 3 property of 10% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on five comparable sales that range in sale price from \$40.63 to \$105.58 per square foot of living area, including land.

At hearing, the appellant's attorney stated that the recent sale of the subject is the best evidence of the subject's market value. She stated that the sale was a foreclosure sale, but that it was advertised on the open market, the seller's mortgage was not assumed, and the buyer and seller were not related. The board of review's representative stated the sale is a compulsory sale and does not represent the subject's fair market value as the subject was sold pursuant to a foreclosure.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that the sale of the subject on April 22, 2013 for a price of \$155,000 was a compulsory sale. A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete. 35 ILCS 200/1-23.

Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party. Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so. <u>Bd. of Educ. of Meridian Cmty. Unit Sch. Dist. No. 223 v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd.</u>, 2011 IL App (2d) 100068, ¶ 36 (citing <u>Chrysler Corp. v. Ill. Prop. Tax Appeal Bd.</u>, 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, when there is a recent sale of the subject, and that sale is a compulsory sale, the Board may consider evidence which would show whether the sale price was representative of the subject's fair cash value. See 35 ILCS 200/16-183 ("The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer."). Such evidence can include the descriptive and sales information for recently sold properties that are similar to the subject. See Id.

The Board finds the board of review's comparable sales #2, #3, and #5 had sale prices that ranged from \$40.63 to \$63.41 per square foot of living area. The subject's recent purchase price of \$12.86 per square foot of living area is well below these range of the comparables and therefore does not represent the fair market value of the subject building. In addition, the subject's current assessment reflects a market value of \$40.58 per square foot of living area which is below this range. The Board finds the appellant has not met the burden of proving by a preponderance of the evidence that the subject's April 22, 2013 foreclosure sale price represents the subject's market value on January 1, 2014. Based on this evidence, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(b) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(b)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

, Ma	uno Illorias
	Chairman
21. Fer	C. R.
Member	Acting Member
Sobet Stoffen	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	January 16, 2018
	Stee M Wagner
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Pangea Equity, by attorney: Maureen C. Pikarski Gordon & Pikarski 55 West Monroe Street Suite 1700 Chicago, IL 60603

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602