

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Yasir Kanan
DOCKET NO.: 14-21417.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 19-25-201-040-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Yasir Kanan, the appellant(s), by attorney Michael R. Davies, of the Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. in Oak Lawn; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>A Reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$3,053 **IMPR.:** \$4,447 **TOTAL:** \$7,500

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2014 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board (the "Board") finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject consists of a two-story apartment building of masonry construction containing 3,001 square feet of living area. The property is located in Lake Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. No evidence was submitted as to whether the subject was owner occupied.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on July 2014 for a price of \$75,000. In Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the Board's residential appeal form, the appellant stated that the subject's sale was not a transfer between family or related corporations, was sold by a realtor, and was advertised on the open market for two months, and that the

mortgage was not assumed. The appellant's attorney also submitted a copy of the settlement statement showing realtor fees were paid.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$18,688. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$186,880, or \$62.27 per square foot of living area, when applying the 2014 statutory level of assessment for class 2 property of 10.00% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted two sale comparables. These comparables sold in 2011 and 2012 for \$58.58 and \$63.52 per square foot of living area, are 58 and 82 years old and contain 1,968 and 2,646 square feet of living area.

At hearing, the board of review representative argued that the sale of the subject was a compulsory sale, and therefore, the sale was not an arm's length transaction and the sale price does not represent the subject's fair cash value. In support of this argument, the board of review submitted the printout from the Cook County Recorder of Deeds' website. This document was allowed into the record as Exhibit "A" with no objection from the appellant's attorney.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds that the sale of the subject in July 1, 2014 for \$75,000 was a "compulsory sale." A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

(i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. The Board finds that the sale of the subject in July 2014 is a compulsory sale, in the form of a foreclosure, based on the printout from the Cook County Recorder of Deeds' website submitted by the board of review.

Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Board of Educ. of Meridian Community Unit School Dist. No. 223 v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 961 N.E.2d 794, 802, 356 Ill.Dec. 405, 413 (2d Dist. 2011) (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211, 387 N.E.2d 351 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, the Illinois General Assembly recently provided very clear guidance for the Board with regards to compulsory sales. Section 16-183 of the Illinois Property Tax Code states as follows:

The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer.

35 ILCS 200/16-183. Therefore, the Board is statutorily required to consider the compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the parties to revise and/or correct the subject's assessment. In this appeal, the board of review submitted information on two comparable sales These comparables sold in 2011 and 2012 for \$58.58 and \$63.52 per square foot of living area, are 58 and 82 years old and contain 1,968 and 2,646 square feet of living area.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in July 2014 for a price of \$75,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction, including disclosing that the parties to the transaction were not related, that the property was sold using a Realtor, and that it was advertised on the open market with a listing on the MLS for approximately two months. In further support of the transaction, the appellant submitted the settlement statement. The Board finds the board of review did not present any convincing evidence to refute the contention that the purchase price was reflective of market value. Based on this record the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$75,000 as of January 1, 2014. Since market value has been determined the 2013 statutory level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 10.00% shall apply. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(2).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(b) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(b)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.

Mauro Illorioso	
	Chairman
21. Fer	C. R.
Member	Member
Sobet Stoffen	Dan Dikini
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	March 20, 2018
	Stee M Wagner
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board William G. Stratton Building, Room 402 401 South Spring Street Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Yasir Kanan, by attorney: Michael R. Davies Law Offices of Michael R. Davies, Ltd. 5533 West 109th Street, Unit 219 Oak Lawn, IL 60453

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review County Building, Room 601 118 North Clark Street Chicago, IL 60602