

### FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Julie Ann Sebastian DOCKET NO.: 14-20027.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 15-12-217-029-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Julie Ann Sebastian, the appellant; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>a reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

> LAND: \$ 1,244 IMPR.: \$ 14,118 TOTAL: \$ 15,362

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

# Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2014 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

### Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story, masonry dwelling with 1,190 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 72 years old. The property has a 1,464 square foot site and is located in River Forest, River Forest Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-10 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends assessment inequity and overvaluation as the bases of the appeal. In support of the equity argument, the appellant submitted information on four equity comparables. The

PTAB/JMG

comparables range in improvement assessments from \$9.15 to \$10.77 per square foot.

In support of the overvaluation argument, the appellant submitted sales data for the same suggested comparables. The comparables ranged: in size from 1,022 to 1,190 square feet of living area; in sale date from June 2013 to August 2014; and in sales price from \$120,000 to \$150,000, or from \$117.41 to \$130.25 per square foot, including land. All of these sales were short sales.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review-Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$19,270. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$18,026, or \$15.15 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$194,058, or \$163.07 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2014 three year average median level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 9.93% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables ranging in improvement assessment per square foot from \$17.99 to \$19.26. No evidence was submitted to support the subject's current market value.

## Conclusion of Law

The taxpayer contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity to be the appellant's comparables and the board of review's comparables. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$9.15 to \$19.26 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment of \$15.15 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. Accordingly, the Board finds the appellant did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed, and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified on this basis.

The appellant also contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation.

Docket No: 14-20027.001-R-1

When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be appellant's comparable sales. These comparables are most similar to the subject in size, location and amenities, and sold in a time proximate to the January 1, 2014 valuation date. Although these sales were short sales, the Property Tax Appeal Board must consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer. (See 35 ILCS 200/16-183.) These comparables sold for prices ranging from \$117.41 to \$130.25 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$163.07 per square foot of living area, including land, which is above the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. Based on this evidence the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is justified based on overvaluation. This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Chairman

Member

Member

Acting Member

DISSENTING:

<u>CERTIFICATION</u>

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

November 20, 2015

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

Mano Morios

Member

eny White

Acting Member

Docket No: 14-20027.001-R-1

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.