



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Jeff Aeder
DOCKET NO.: 13-35320.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 13-35-211-025-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Jeff Aeder, the appellant(s), by attorney Robert Rosenfeld, of Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 3,600
IMPR.: \$20,358
TOTAL: \$23,958

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2013 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story multi-family dwelling of frame construction containing 3,132 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 116 years old. The property has a 3,000 square foot site and is located in Jefferson Township, Cook County. The property is a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted a copy of a previous PTAB decision and evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on September 9, 2011 for a price of \$128,500. This evidence included the settlement statement and a copy of the sales contract. The appellant's attorney failed to complete Section IV- Recent Sale Data in the pleadings with relevant information regarding the sale, and no other evidence was provided regarding the arms-length nature of the transaction. Lastly, appellant requested that the Board apply the 10% level of assessment as determined by

the Cook County Real Estate Classification Ordinance. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$23,958. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$239,580 or \$76.49 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the level of assessment for class 2 properties of 10.00% as determined by the Cook County classification ordinance.

In support of the assessment, the board of review submitted a brief outlining their argument and indicating that the subject is not owner-occupied and therefore not eligible for a rollover, and a deed trail and a grid listing eight sale comparables. These properties sold from January 2012 to July 2013 for prices ranging from \$120.99 to \$165.89 per square foot of living area, including land. In addition, the board of review submitted a brief stating that the subject's sale was not at fair market value due to the deed trail confirming that a *lis pendens* lien was placed on the subject on January 29, 2014.

At hearing, the board of review representative submitted a copy of a previous PTAB decision which was allowed into the record.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c).

In addressing the appellant's market value argument, the Board finds that the sale of the subject in September 2011 for \$128,500, or \$41.02 per square foot of living area, is a "compulsory sale." A "compulsory sale" is defined as:

- (i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and
- (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Board of Educ. of Meridian Community Unit School Dist. No. 223 v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 961 N.E.2d 794, 802, 356 Ill.Dec. 405, 413 (2d Dist. 2011) citing Chrysler Corp. v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211 387 N.E.2d 351 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, the Illinois General Assembly recently provided very clear guidance for the Board with regards to compulsory sales. Section 16-183 of the Illinois Property Tax Code states as follows:

The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of the comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer.

35 ILCS 200/16-183. Therefore, the Board is statutorily required to consider the compulsory sale of comparable properties submitted by the parties to revise and/or correct the subject's assessment. The Board finds that the mere assertion that the subject's sale was not at market solely because it is a compulsory sale is accorded no weight without evidence supporting that assertion.

In determining the fair market value of the subject property, the Board looks to the evidence presented by the parties. The appellant's attorney failed to complete Section IV- Recent Sale Data in the pleadings with relevant information regarding the sale, no other evidence was provided regarding the arms-length nature of the transaction of the sale, and no comparable sales were provided in support of the sale price of the subject. Also, the subject is not eligible for a rollover as the subject is not owner-occupied.

The Board finds the board of review's comparables set the range of market value for the subject. Therefore, the best evidence of market value is the board of review's comparables #1, #3, and #4. These comparables sold for prices ranging from \$122.24 to \$165.89 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$76.491 per square foot of living area, including land, which is below the range established by the best comparable sales in this record. Moreover, the subject's sale price of \$128,500 or \$41.02 per square foot of living area, including land is drastically below the range established by the market data. Based on this evidence the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code. Pursuant to Section 1910.50(b) of the rules of the Property Tax Appeal Board (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(b)) the proceeding before the Property Tax Appeal Board is terminated when the decision is rendered. The Property Tax Appeal Board does not require any motion or request for reconsideration.



Chairman



Acting Member

Member



Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: November 21, 2017



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year or years of the same general assessment period, as provided in Sections 9-125 through 9-225, are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for such subsequent year or years directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR OR YEARS. A separate petition and evidence must be filed for each of the remaining years of the general assessment period.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.

PARTIES OF RECORD

AGENCY

State of Illinois
Property Tax Appeal Board
William G. Stratton Building, Room 402
401 South Spring Street
Springfield, IL 62706-4001

APPELLANT

Jeff Aeder, by attorney:
Robert Rosenfeld
Robert H. Rosenfeld and Associates, LLC
33 North Dearborn Street
Suite 1850
Chicago, IL 60602

COUNTY

Cook County Board of Review
County Building, Room 601
118 North Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60602