



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Abraham & Anne Bronner
DOCKET NO.: 12-33780.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 14-33-306-042-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Abraham & Anne Bronner, the appellants, by attorney Michael D. Gertner, of Michael D. Gertner, Ltd. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds **No Change** in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$20,664
IMPR.: \$231,560
TOTAL: \$252,224

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellants timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2012 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a three-story dwelling of masonry exterior construction with 5,565 square feet of living area. The dwelling is approximately 13 years old. Features of the home include a full unfinished basement, central air conditioning, two fireplaces and a two-car garage. The property has a 2,952 square foot site and is located in Chicago, North Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-09 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellants contend assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal¹. In support of this argument the appellants submitted information on three equity comparables with the same neighborhood assessment code as the subject property. The comparables are improved with

¹ The appellants submitted the PTAB1A marking comparable sales as the basis of the appeal. The appellants failed to submit sales information on the assessment grid analysis but provided assessment information.

three-story dwellings of masonry or stucco exterior construction that range from 19 to 134 years old. The comparables had features with varying degrees of similarity when compared to the subject. The dwellings range in size from 5,058 to 5,616 square feet of living area and have improvement assessments ranging from \$183,393 to \$199,903 or from \$33.16 to \$37.01² per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the appellants requested the total assessment be reduced to \$218,088.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$252,224. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$231,560 or \$41.61 per square foot of living area. In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables located with the same neighborhood assessment code or within .25 of a mile from the subject property. The comparables are improved with three-story dwellings of masonry exterior construction that range from 4 to 56 years old. The comparables had features with varying degrees of similarity when compared to the subject. The dwellings range in size from 5,752 to 6,856 square feet of living area and have improvement assessments that range from \$305,454 to \$369,460 or from \$46.63 to \$64.23 per square foot of living area. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The taxpayers contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellants did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted information on a total of seven suggested equity comparables for the Board's consideration. The Board gave less weight to the appellants' comparables #1 and #2 due to their older age when compared to the subject property. The Board also gave less weight to the board of review's comparables #3 and #4 due to their differences in age and/or size when compared to the subject property. The Board finds the appellants' comparable #3 and the board of review's comparables #1 and #2 are more similar when compared to the subject in location, age, design, dwelling size and features. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from of \$37.01 to \$64.23 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$41.61 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record the Board finds the appellants did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

² The appellants' attorney converted the improvement assessments of the comparables to reflect their estimated market values ranging from \$331.60 to \$370.12 per square foot of living area.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.



Chairman



Member



Member

Member



Acting Member

DISSENTING: _____

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: October 21, 2016



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of

the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.