

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Izer Shabani DOCKET NO.: 12-31513.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 06-13-407-022-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Izer Shabani, the appellant, by attorney Steven A. Salzman, of Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$2,764 **IMPR.:** \$14,800 **TOTAL:** \$17,564

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2012 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a one-story dwelling of frame construction with 913 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 39 years old. Features of the home include a full finished basement, central air conditioning and a two and one-half car garage. The property has a 8,505 square foot site and is located in Streamwood, Hanover Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-02 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted limited evidence disclosing the subject was purchased on May 25, 2012 for a price of \$75,000. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for subject of \$17,564. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$175,640 or \$192.38 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the level of assessments for class 2 property of 10% under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of the assessment the board of review submitted a grid analysis containing four comparable sales that occurred from May 1, 2010 to October 1, 2011 for prices ranging from \$177,000 to \$182,000 or from \$184.58 to \$198.21 per square foot of living area, including land. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The appellant provided limited evidence of the sale of the subject. The appellant failed to complete Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal which would have disclosed the manner in which the subject property was advertised on the open market and the length of time the property was marketed. The appellant's evidence included a brief which disclosed the purported purchaser, the seller and the brokers involved in the transaction. The brief further reveals that the parties to the sale transaction were not related, however, the brief claims a copy of the RESPA Settlement Statement, Bill of Sale and Warranty Deed with affixed transfer stamps were attached, but they were not. Due to the lack of substantive documentary evidence to support the assertion the subject's sale was arm's-length, the Board gives the subject's sale price little weight.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value in the record to be the board of review's comparable #1. This comparable was similar to the subject in location, style, construction, features, age and land area. This property also sold proximate in time to the assessment date at issue. The comparable sold in October 2011 for a price of \$182,000 or \$184.58 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$175,640 or \$192.38 per square foot of living area, including land, which is below the market value of the best comparable in this record on a total market value basis and slightly above the market value on a per square foot basis. Accepted real estate valuation theory provides, all other factors being equal, as the size of a property increases, its per unit value decreases. Likewise, as the size of a property decreases, its per unit value increases. Based on this analysis, the Board finds the subject's higher per square foot improvement assessment is well justified given its smaller size. Lastly, the Board finds the subject is superior to the board of review's comparable #1 due to the subject's full finished basement and newer dwelling. The Board gave less weight to the remaining comparables submitted by the board of review due to their sale dates occurring greater than 17 months prior to the January 1, 2012 assessment date. Based on this record the Board

finds the subject's assessment is reflective of market value and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

, Ma	uro Morioso
	Chairman
21. Fer	a R
Member	Member
Sobet Stoffen	Dan De Kinin
Member	Acting Member
DISSENTING:	

<u>CERTIFICATIO</u>N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	November 23, 2016
	Alportol
	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of

the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.