

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Franklin Holdings LLC

DOCKET NO.: 12-27385.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 16-23-111-011-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Franklin Holdings LLC, the appellant, by attorney Timothy E. Moran of Schmidt Salzman & Moran, Ltd in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented in this matter, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds *No Change* in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$6,037 **IMPR.:** \$3,118 **TOTAL:** \$9,155

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2012 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a three-story, multi-family dwelling of masonry construction. The dwelling is an apartment building that is approximately 100 years old and has 8,367 square feet of living area. Features of the building include six apartment units and a full unfinished basement. The property has a 6,037 square foot site and is located in Chicago, West Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on July 28, 2011 for a price of \$40,000. In Section IV – Recent Sale Data of the appeal form, the appellant stated the seller was IB Property Holdings, LLC, the sale was not been related parties; the property was sold by a realtor; and the property sold in settlement of a contract for deed. The appellant did not answer

Docket No: 12-27385.001-R-1

questions that asked if the property had been advertised for sale, how was it advertised, and for how long. To document the transaction, the appellant submitted a contract for sale of real estate at auction and documents regarding the resumption of water service at the subject property. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$9,155. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$91,550 or \$10.94 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the 10% level of assessment for class 2 residential properties under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales that sold from March 2009 to February 2010 for prices that ranged from \$195,000 to \$325,000 or from \$79.46 to \$113.27 per square foot of living area, land included.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

Although the appellant indicated the subject sold in June 2011 for a price of \$40,000, the appellant did not provide sufficient evidence to demonstrate that the subject's sale was an arm's length transaction. The appellant failed to establish that the property had been exposed on the open market; the amount of time the property was advertised, if any; and whether the sale was the result of a foreclosure due to the seller being identified as a financial entity. The Board finds, due to the lack of data, the appellant failed to provide sufficient evidence to challenge the correctness of the assessment so as to shift the burden of proof to the Cook County Board of Review. (86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(a)&(b)). Furthermore, the sales provided by the board of review indicate the subject's purchase price was not reflective of fair cash value. Based on the evidence in the record, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

Docket No: 12-27385.001-R-1

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

	Mauro Illorias
	Chairman
	a R
Member	Member Local Stoffen
Member	Member
DISSENTING:	
<u>CERTIFICATION</u>	
As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.	
Date:	June 24, 2016
	Afrotol

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the

Docket No: 12-27385.001-R-1

session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.