

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Wilson & Anna Mukkada

DOCKET NO.: 12-02924.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 11-02-201-132

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Wilson & Anna Mukkada, the appellants, and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds  $\underline{no\ change}$  in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$46,189 **IMPR.:** \$110,775 **TOTAL:** \$156,964

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellants timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2012 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

#### Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 3,188 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1998. Features of the home include a full basement, central air conditioning, a fireplace and a three-car garage. The property has a 13,023 square foot

site and is located in Libertyville, Libertyville Township, Lake County.

The appellants contend both assessment inequity and overvaluation as the bases of the appeal. In support of these arguments, the appellants submitted information on three comparables with equity data and sales information for two of the comparables.

Based on this evidence, the appellants requested an improvement assessment of \$90,835 or \$28.49 per square foot of living area with a total assessment of \$137,024 which would reflect a market value of approximately \$411,072 or \$128.94 per square foot of living area, including land.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$156,964. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$110,775 or \$34.75 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment also reflects a market value of \$479,719 or \$150.48 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2012 three year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 32.72% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparables with equity data where three of the comparables included sales information.

Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

## Conclusion of Law

The taxpayers contend assessment inequity as a basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellants did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties submitted a total of seven equity comparables to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board. All seven comparables are similar to the subject in location, age, exterior construction, size, foundation, central air conditioning and garage size. The Board finds these comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$30.35 to \$35.24 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$34.75 per square foot of living area falls within the range established by the comparables in this record. Based on this record the Board finds the appellants did not demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

The appellants also contend the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellants did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The parties presented five comparable sales to support their respective positions before the Property Tax Appeal Board. Each of the comparables are similar to the subject in location, age, size, foundation and/or features. The Board finds the comparables sold between September 2010 and November 2012 for prices ranging from \$407,500 to \$515,000 or from \$134.09 to \$166.77 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$479,719 or \$150.48 per square foot of living area, including land, which is within the range established by the comparable sales in this record. Based on this evidence the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

In conclusion, the Board finds the appellants have failed to prove unequal treatment in the assessment process by clear and convincing evidence, or overvaluation by a preponderance of the evidence, and that the subject's assessment as established by the board of review is correct and no reduction is warranted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Chairman Mauro Illorios Member Member Acting Member DISSENTING:

#### CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

> August 21, 2015 Date: Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.