



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Ayoub Youshaei
DOCKET NO.: 12-02112.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 16-04-206-006

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Ayoub Youshaei, the appellant, by attorney Eli R. Johnson of Robert H. Rosenfeld & Associates, LLC in Chicago; and the Lake County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds no change in the assessment of the property as established by the **Lake** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$60,764
IMPR.: \$37,706
TOTAL: \$98,470

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Lake County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) disputing the assessment for the 2012 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property is improved with a one-story single family dwelling of brick construction with 1,340 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1955. Features of the home include an unfinished basement, one fireplace and a detached two-car garage with 528 square feet of building area.

The property has an 8,879 square foot site and is located in Lake Forest, Moraine Township, Lake County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on three comparable sales improved with one-story dwellings of brick exterior construction that had either 1,334 or 1,519 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 1954 to 1956. Each comparable had a basement with one being partially finished and central air conditioning. One comparable had a fireplace and two comparables had a one-car attached garage. Each comparable had a different assessment neighborhood code than the subject and were located from 1.46 to 1.97 miles from the subject property. The sales occurred from October 2010 to April 2011 for prices ranging from \$218,300 to \$300,000 or from \$161.29 to \$197.50 per square foot of living area, including land. The appellant requested the subject's assessment be reduced to \$77,784.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$98,470. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$300,947 or \$224.59 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2012 three year average median level of assessment for Lake County of 32.72% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

The board of review submitted evidence in the form of the PTAX-203 Illinois Real Estate Transfer Declaration disclosing the subject property sold in August 2010 for a price of \$300,000. The board of review also provided a copy of the listing from the Multiple Listing Service (MLS) disclosing the subject property was listed on the market on February 2, 2010 with an original price of \$379,000 and sold in August 2010 for a price of \$300,000.

In further support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales improved with one-story dwellings of wood siding or brick exterior construction that ranged in size from 1,426 to 1,778 square feet of living area. The dwellings were constructed from 1950 to 1959. Each comparable has an unfinished basement, one or two fireplaces and either an attached or detached garage. Two comparables have central air conditioning. The properties have the same assessment neighborhood code as the subject property. The sales occurred from June 2010 to December 2012 for prices ranging from \$347,500 to \$400,000 or from \$218.53 to

\$243.69 per square foot of living area, including land. The board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did not meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be presented by the board of review. The board of review provided evidence that the subject property sold in an arm's length transaction in August 2010 for a price of \$300,000. The Board finds the purchase price is supportive of the subject's assessment. Additionally, the board of review submitted information on three comparable sales improved with dwellings that were relatively similar to the subject property and located in the subject's assessment neighborhood. These comparables sold for prices ranging from \$218.53 to \$243.69 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$224.59 per square foot of living area, including land, which is within the range established by the board of review comparable sales on a square foot basis. Less weight was given the appellant's comparables due to location. Based on this evidence the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is not justified.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Chairman



Member



Member

Member



Member

DISSENTING: _____

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: April 24, 2015



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.