

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Stark Properties LLC DOCKET NO.: 12-01453.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 03-12-128-033

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Stark Properties LLC, the appellant, by attorney Jerri K. Bush in Chicago, and the Kane County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>a reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Kane** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$13,631
IMPR.:	\$3,711
TOTAL:	\$17,342

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Kane County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2012 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a one-story dwelling of frame construction with 960 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1956. Features of the home include a crawlspace foundation and a detached 253 square foot garage. The property is located in Carpentersville, Dundee Township, Kane County. The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on March 16, 2012 for a price of \$52,000. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$24,658. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$73,937 or \$77.02 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2012 three year average median level of assessment for Kane County of 33.35% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on six comparable sales that occurred between August 2011 and April 2013. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

In written rebuttal, appellant's counsel contended that the sale price of the subject property when an arm's length transaction is synonymous with fair cash value as determined by case law applying the provisions of the Property Tax Code.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Property Tax Appeal Board has given reduced weight to board of review comparable sales #1, #3, #4 and #5 as each of these homes has central air conditioning which is not a feature of the subject dwelling.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in March, 2012, a date three months after the valuation date at issue, for a price of \$52,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a Realtor, the property had been advertised on the open market with the Multiple Listing Service and it had been on the market for 193 days. The Listing & Property History Report submitted by the appellant reflects the original asking in June 2011 was \$70,000 with two subsequent price reductions for a final asking price of \$52,000 in December 2011 prior to the purchase by the appellant. In further support of the transaction the appellant submitted a copy of the Settlement Statement which depicted the payment of brokers' fees as part of the transaction.

The Property Tax Appeal Board finds the purchase price of \$52,000 is below the market value reflected by the assessment of \$73,937. Moreover, the Board finds the subject's estimated market value is also higher than the original asking price of the subject property. Since an asking price generally reflects the upper limit of value, the Board finds this fact further supports the contention that the subject property is overvalued, particularly given that it was on the market for 193 days. Therefore, while the board of review presented comparable sales #2 and #6 that had similarities to the subject property, the Board finds this evidence does not overcome the apparent arm's length nature of the subject's sale transaction. Furthermore, the Board finds the board of review did not present any evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the subject's sale transaction or to refute the contention that the purchase price was reflective of market value in light of the asking price evidence of record.

Based on this record the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$52,000 as of January 1, 2012. Since market value has been determined the 2012 three year average median level of assessment for Kane County of 33.35% shall apply. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(1).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

~	1.	
	<i>—</i> .	nen

Member

Member

Chairman

Mauro Alloriose

Member eng Whit

Acting Member

DISSENTING:

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

June 26, 2015

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

Docket No: 12-01453.001-R-1

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.