

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Bahar Baniasad
DOCKET NO.: 11-27910.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 14-32-407-073-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Bahar Baniasad, the appellant, by attorney Joanne Elliott, of Elliott & Associates, P.C. in Des Plaines; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>a reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$10,800 **IMPR.:** \$11,700 **TOTAL:** \$22,500

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2011 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

### Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story, multi-family dwelling of frame and masonry construction. The dwelling is approximately 126 years old and has 1,845 square feet of living area. Features of the dwelling include two apartment units and a crawl-space foundation. The property has a 1,440 square foot site and is located in Chicago, North Chicago Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-11 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on September 29, 2010 for a price of \$225,000. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$47,054. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$470,540 or \$255.04 per square foot of living area, land included, when applying the 10% level of assessment for class 2 residential properties under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four comparable sales. In addition, the board of review submitted a supplemental brief challenging the arm's length nature of the subject's sale. The board of review submitted evidence indicating the subject's 2010 sale was compulsory due to a pending foreclosure. This evidence consisted of print-outs from the Cook County Recorder of Deeds' website and a copy of a notice of foreclosure from the Cook County Circuit Court.

The appellant's attorney submitted a rebuttal brief.

#### Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in September 2010 for a price of \$225,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length transaction. The appellant completed Section IV - Recent Sale Data of the appeal disclosing the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a realtor, the property had been advertised on the open market with the Multiple Listing Service (MLS) and was on the market for 393 days prior to its sale. In further support of the transaction, the appellant submitted a copy of the settlement statement and the MLS listing sheet. The MLS listing sheet disclosed the subject's listing history. During its 393 days on the market, the subject's original listing price of \$360,000 was reduced first to \$265,000 and later to its sale price of \$225,000. The Board finds the purchase price is below the market value reflected by the assessment.

The Board finds the board of review presented evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction but was not able to refute the appellant's contention that the subject's purchase price was reflective of market value. The board of review presented four comparable sales that sold from February to September 2010 for prices that ranged from \$620,000 to \$1,173,750 per square foot of living area, land included. These sales tend to support the conclusion that the subject's purchase price was reflective of its market value given that the board of review comparable sales were superior to the subject in varying degrees. As a result, the Board gave the board of review's market evidence reduced weight.

Based on the evidence in the record, the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment commensurate with the appellant's request is appropriate.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Maus Illorios	
	Chairman
	R
Member	Member
Jerry White	Robert Stoffen
Acting Member	Member
DISSENTING:	

## <u>C E R T I F I C A T I O N</u>

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: April 22, 2016

April 22, 2016

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the

subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.