

# FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Daniel J. Nagle
DOCKET NO.: 11-24166.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 28-09-201-076-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Daniel J. Nagle, the appellant(s), by attorney David C. Dunkin, of Arnstein & Lehr, LLP in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>a reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$ 284 **IMPR.:** \$ 10,155 **TOTAL:** \$ 10,439

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

#### Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2011 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

### Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story townhome of frame and masonry construction with 1,201 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1990. Features of the home include one and one-half baths, air conditioning, and a one car

garage. The property has a 1,036 square foot site and is located in Midlothian, Bremen Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2-95 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence showing that the subject sold in February 2009 for \$110,000. This evidence included a copy of the deed with affixed transfer stamps, a printout from the Recorder of Deeds confirming sale date and price, and a multiple listing sheet. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$15,176. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$159,916 or \$133.15 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2011 three year average median level of assessment for class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance of 9.49% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted thee equity comparables and sales data for each comparable. Also, the board of review confirmed the subject's sale date and price.

## Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the purchase of the subject property in February 2009 for \$110,000. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of arm's length transaction and in support of the transaction, the appellant submitted a copy of the deed with affixed transfer stamps, a printout from the Recorder of Deeds confirming sale date and price, and the multiple listing sheet.

Lastly, the board of review failed to provide any evidence to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction.

Based on this record, the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$110,000 as of January 1, 2011. Since market value has been determined the 2011 three year average median level of assessments for class 2, residential property of 9.49% shall apply as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. 86 Ill.Admin.Code  $\S1910.50(c)(2)$ .

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

	Chairman
21. Fer	Mauro Illorias
Member	Member
C R	
Member	Acting Member
Robert Stoffen	
Acting Member	
DISSENTING:	

## CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:	February 19, 2016
	Alportol
•	Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.