



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Socorro Clarke
DOCKET NO.: 11-20242.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 11-30-107-029-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Socorro Clarke, the appellant, by attorney Brian S. Maher, of Weis, DuBrock, Doody & Maher in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 5,036
IMPR.: \$ 7,870
TOTAL: \$ 12,906

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2011 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 1,145 square feet of living area. The dwelling is 51 years old. Features of the home include a

full, unfinished basement and central air conditioning. The property has a 4,286 square foot site and is located in Evanston Township, Cook County. The property is a class 2-95 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument, the appellant submitted evidence of the recent sale of the subject.

The recent sale evidence disclosed the subject property was purchased on May 21, 2010 for a price of \$136,001. The appellant also submitted the settlement statement disclosing the seller as U.S. Bank National Association and a Special Warranty Deed. The evidence indicates the subject was a foreclosure property marketed by a realtor. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's market value.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review-Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$20,486. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$215,869, or \$188.53 per square foot, including land, when applying the 2011 three year median level of assessment of 9.49% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted four equity comparables. The board also noted the sale of the subject property on its grid sheet as \$136,500. No further evidence was submitted.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant did meet this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds that the best evidence of the subject's market value is the evidence of the sale of the subject in May 2010 for a price of \$136,001. The appellant provided evidence demonstrating the sale had the elements of an arm's length

transaction. The evidence disclosed that: the parties to the transaction were not related, the property was sold using a realtor, and the property had been advertised on the open market. In further support of the transaction the appellant submitted copies of closing documents.

The appellant also indicated that the sale of the subject was a compulsory sale. A "compulsory sale" is defined as

(i) the sale of real estate for less than the amount owed to the mortgage lender or mortgagor, if the lender or mortgagor has agreed to the sale, commonly referred to as a "short sale" and (ii) the first sale of real estate owned by a financial institution as a result of a judgment of foreclosure, transfer pursuant to a deed in lieu of foreclosure, or consent judgment, occurring after the foreclosure proceeding is complete.

35 ILCS 200/1-23. Real property in Illinois must be assessed at its fair cash value, which can only be estimated absent any compulsion on either party.

Illinois law requires that all real property be valued at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale where the owner is ready, willing, and able to sell but not compelled to do so, and the buyer is likewise ready, willing, and able to buy, but is not forced to do so.

Board of Educ. of Meridian Community Unit School Dist. No. 223 v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 961 N.E.2d 794, 802, 356 Ill.Dec. 405, 413 (2d Dist. 2011) (citing Chrysler Corp. v. Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board, 69 Ill.App.3d 207, 211, 387 N.E.2d 351 (2d Dist. 1979)).

However, the Illinois General Assembly recently provided very clear guidance for the Board with regards to compulsory sales. Section 16-183 of the Illinois Property Tax Code states as follows:

The Property Tax Appeal Board shall consider compulsory sales of comparable properties for the purpose of revising and correcting assessments, including those compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the taxpayer.

35 ILCS 200/16-183. Therefore, the Board is statutorily required to consider the compulsory sales of comparable properties submitted by the parties to revise and/or correct the subject's assessment. The Board finds that the mere assertion that the subject's sale was not at market solely because it is a compulsory sale is accorded no weight without evidence supporting that assertion.

In the instant case, the evidence indicated that the sale of the subject was a foreclosure. However, the Board finds the board of review failed to provide any evidence either to challenge the arm's length nature of the transaction or to refute the contention that the purchase price was reflective of the market. Therefore, based on this record, the Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$136,001 as of January 1, 2011. Since market value has been determined the 2011 three year median level of assessment for class 2, residential property of 9.49% shall apply as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.50(c)(2)

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Chairman



Member

Member



Member

Acting Member



Acting Member

DISSENTING: _____

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: January 22, 2016



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.