

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Michael Hara DOCKET NO.: 10-28243.001-R-1 PARCEL NO.: 05-21-202-012-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Michael Hara, the appellant(s), by attorney Adam E. Bossov, of the Law Offices of Adam E. Bossov, P.C. in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>a reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

| LAND: | \$ 37,111 |
|--------|------------|
| IMPR.: | \$ 79,109 |
| TOTAL: | \$ 116,220 |

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2010 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story dwelling of frame and masonry construction with 4,003 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1942. Features of the home include a partial unfinished basement, two fireplaces, three Docket No: 10-28243.001-R-1

baths, and three-car garage. The property has a 22,838 square foot site and is located in Winnetka, New Trier Township, Cook County.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted an appraisal estimating the subject property had a market value of \$1,300,000 as of January 1, 2010. In addition, the appellant's attorney requested that pursuant to <u>Hoyne Savings & Loan Association v.</u> <u>Hare</u>, PTAB's 2011 reduction decision should be applied to this appeal.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$165,096. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,846,711 or \$461.33 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2010 three year average median level of assessment for Cook County of 8.94% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted threer equity comparables and sales data for each comparable.

Conclusion of Law

Evidence showing that the subject received a reduction in a later year is admissible, and can be a relevant factor in determining whether the assessment for the tax year at issue is grossly excessive. Hoyne Savings & Loan Ass'n v. Hare, 60 Ill. 2d 84, 90 (1974. However, when such evidence is taken into account, consideration must be given to any changes in the property that may have changed the subject's assessed value. Hoyne, 60 Ill. 2d at 90. After an analysis of the assessment data, the Board finds that a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board finds that under <u>Hoyne</u>, it cannot consider the 2011 reduction by the board of review because the appellant failed to submit any evidence of the subject's condition for the 2010 tax year for comparison. Therefore, the Board finds that a reduction is not warranted.

The appellant also contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the Docket No: 10-28243.001-R-1

property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appraisal submitted by the appellant. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,846,711, which is above the best evidence of market value in the record. The Board finds the subject property had a market value of \$1,300,000 as of the assessment date at issue. Since market value has been established the 2010 three year average median level of assessments for Cook County of 8.94% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue shall apply. (86 Ill.Admin.Code \$1910.50(c)(1)).

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Member

Member

Chairman

Mano Moiros

Member my Whit

Acting Member

Acting Member

DISSENTING:

CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

December 18, 2015

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.