

## FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD

APPELLANT: Starboard Ventures Realty, LLC DOCKET NO.: 09-34476.001-I-1 PARCEL NO.: 32-35-201-013-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Starboard Ventures Realty, LLC, the appellant, by attorney Michael E. Crane, of Crane and Norcross in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds <u>a reduction</u> in the assessment of the property as established by the **Cook** County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND:	\$ 39,933
IMPR.:	\$106,296
TOTAL:	\$146,229

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

## Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

## Findings of Fact

The subject consists of a one-story industrial building containing 20,553 square feet of building area. It was constructed in 1993 and is situated on a 174,252 square foot

PTAB/JMG

site. It is located in Bloom Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 5-93 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted an appraisal estimating the subject property had a market value of \$500,000 as of January 1, 2008.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$246,228. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$984,912, or \$47.92 per square foot of living area, including land, when applying the 2009 assessment level of 25% as established by the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance. In support of the subject's assessment, the board of review submitted raw sales data for five industrial buildings located within nine miles of the The sales data was collected from the CoStar Comps subject. service, and the CoStar Comps sheets state that the research was licensed to the Cook County Assessor's Office. However, the board of review included a memorandum which states that the submission of these comparables is not intended to be an appraisal or an estimate of value, and should not be construed The memorandum further states that the information as such. provided was collected from various sources, and was assumed to be factual, accurate, and reliable; but that the information had not been verified, and that the board of review did not warrant its accuracy. Based on this evidence, the board of review requested confirmation of the subject's assessment.

## Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

In determining the fair market value of the subject property, the Board finds the best evidence to be the appellant's appraisal. The appellant's appraisers utilized the three approaches to value in determining the subject's market value. The Board finds this appraisal to be persuasive for the appraisers: have experience in appraising; personally inspected the subject property and reviewed the property's history; estimated a highest and best use for the subject property; utilized appropriate market data in undertaking the sales comparison approach to value; and lastly, used similar properties in the sales comparison approach while providing sufficient detail regarding each sale as well as adjustments that were necessary. The Board gives little weight to the board of review's comparables as the information provided was raw sales data with no adjustments made for location, size, date of sale, age, land-to-building ratio, or other related factors.

Therefore, the Board finds that a reduction in the subject's market value is warranted and an assessment reduction to the appellant's request is granted.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Chairman

			2
~	1	=-F	2
	2.	per	

Member

Mauro Minino

Member

DISSENTING:

# Member

Member

#### CERTIFICATION

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date:

April 24, 2015

Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

#### IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

Docket No: 09-34476.001-I-1

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A <u>PETITION AND EVIDENCE</u> WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.