



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Matthew Thornton
DOCKET NO.: 09-31272.001-R-1
PARCEL NO.: 05-21-304-004-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Matthew Thornton, the appellant(s), by attorney Jason T. Shilson, of O'Keefe Lyons & Hynes, LLC in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds a reduction in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

LAND: \$ 30,112
IMPR.: \$ 113,786
TOTAL: \$ 143,898

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

Statement of Jurisdiction

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

Findings of Fact

The subject property consists of a two-story, single-family dwelling of frame construction with 3,991 square feet of living area. The dwelling was constructed in 1890. Features of the home include a partial unfinished basement, one fireplace,

central air conditioning, and two and two-half baths. The property has a 16,500 square foot site and is located in Winnetka, New Trier Township, Cook County.

The appellant contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on seven equity comparables and included the corresponding Cook County Assessor's website printouts for each comparable.

The appellant contends overvaluation as the basis of the appeal. In support of this argument the appellant submitted information on 25 comparable sales and included the corresponding Cook County Assessor's and Recorder of Deeds website printouts for each comparable.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$163,052. The subject property has an improvement assessment of \$132,940 or \$33.31 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,832,045 or \$459.04 per square foot of living area, land included, when using the 2009 three year median level of assessment for Cook County of 8.90% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment, the board of review submitted information on four equity comparables and sales data for comparables #2 and #4.

Conclusion of Law

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant met this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is warranted.

The Board finds the best evidence of market value to be the appellant's comparable sales #11, #15, #18, #22 and #24. These similar comparables sold for prices ranging from \$248.56 to \$405.12 per square foot of living area, including land. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$459.04 per square foot of living area, including land, which is above the

range established by the best comparable sales in this record. Based on this evidence the Board finds a reduction in the subject's assessment is justified. Since a reduction was granted per the appellant's market value argument, no further analysis shall be completed regarding appellant's equity argument.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

Chairman



Member



Member



Member



Acting Member

DISSENTING: _____

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: September 18, 2015



Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

IMPORTANT NOTICE

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.