



**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE DECISION  
ILLINOIS PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD**

APPELLANT: Mark Birringer  
DOCKET NO.: 09-22553.001-R-1  
PARCEL NO.: 14-17-314-053-0000

The parties of record before the Property Tax Appeal Board are Mark Birringer, the appellant, by attorney James E. Doherty, of Thomas M. Tully & Associates in Chicago; and the Cook County Board of Review.

Based on the facts and exhibits presented, the Property Tax Appeal Board hereby finds no change in the assessment of the property as established by the Cook County Board of Review is warranted. The correct assessed valuation of the property is:

**LAND:** \$ 15,000  
**IMPR.:** \$ 89,269  
**TOTAL:** \$104,269

Subject only to the State multiplier as applicable.

**Statement of Jurisdiction**

The appellant timely filed the appeal from a decision of the Cook County Board of Review pursuant to section 16-160 of the Property Tax Code (35 ILCS 200/16-160) challenging the assessment for the 2009 tax year. The Property Tax Appeal Board finds that it has jurisdiction over the parties and the subject matter of the appeal.

**Findings of Fact**

The subject property consists of a 10-year-old, two-story dwelling of frame construction with 2,544 square feet of living area. Features of the home include a full basement, central air

conditioning, a fireplace and a two-car garage. The property has a 3,125 square foot site and is located in Lake View Township, Cook County. The subject is classified as a class 2 property under the Cook County Real Property Assessment Classification Ordinance.

The appellant's appeal is based on overvaluation and assessment inequity. In support of the overvaluation argument, the appellant submitted evidence disclosing the subject property was purchased on May 2, 2005 for a price of \$986,000. The appellant also submitted information on three suggested equity comparables. Based on this evidence, the appellant requested a reduction in the subject's assessment to reflect the purchase price.

The board of review submitted its "Board of Review Notes on Appeal" disclosing the total assessment for the subject of \$104,269. The subject has an improvement assessment of \$89,269 or \$35.09 per square foot of living area. The subject's assessment reflects a market value of \$1,171,562 when using the 2009 three year median level of assessments for class 2 property of 8.90% as determined by the Illinois Department of Revenue.

In support of its contention of the correct assessment the board of review submitted information on four suggested equity comparables with sales data on two properties.

#### **Conclusion of Law**

The appellant contends the market value of the subject property is not accurately reflected in its assessed valuation. When market value is the basis of the appeal the value of the property must be proved by a preponderance of the evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of market value may consist of an appraisal of the subject property, a recent sale, comparable sales or construction costs. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(c). The Board finds the appellant *did not meet* this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment is not warranted.

The Board gives no weight to the 2005 sale of the subject because it is four years prior to the current 2009 appeal and the appellant presented no evidence that the market value was the same in 2005 as it is in 2009.

The taxpayer also contends assessment inequity as the basis of the appeal. When unequal treatment in the assessment process is

the basis of the appeal, the inequity of the assessments must be proved by clear and convincing evidence. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.63(e). Proof of unequal treatment in the assessment process should consist of documentation of the assessments for the assessment year in question of not less than three comparable properties showing the similarity, proximity and lack of distinguishing characteristics of the assessment comparables to the subject property. 86 Ill.Admin.Code §1910.65(b). The Board finds the appellant *did not meet* this burden of proof and a reduction in the subject's assessment *is not warranted*.

The Board finds the best evidence of assessment equity for the subject to be *the board of review's comparables* #1, #2, and #4. These comparables had improvement assessments that ranged from \$37.47 to \$39.09 per square foot of living area. The subject's improvement assessment of \$35.09 per square foot of living area falls below the range established by the best comparables in this record. Based on this record the Board finds the appellant *did not* demonstrate with clear and convincing evidence that the subject's improvement was inequitably assessed and a reduction in the subject's assessment *is not justified*.

This is a final administrative decision of the Property Tax Appeal Board which is subject to review in the Circuit Court or Appellate Court under the provisions of the Administrative Review Law (735 ILCS 5/3-101 et seq.) and section 16-195 of the Property Tax Code.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairman



\_\_\_\_\_  
Member



\_\_\_\_\_  
Member

\_\_\_\_\_  
Member



\_\_\_\_\_  
Member

DISSENTING: \_\_\_\_\_

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

As Clerk of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board and the keeper of the Records thereof, I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, full and complete Final Administrative Decision of the Illinois Property Tax Appeal Board issued this date in the above entitled appeal, now of record in this said office.

Date: April 24, 2015



\_\_\_\_\_  
Clerk of the Property Tax Appeal Board

**IMPORTANT NOTICE**

Section 16-185 of the Property Tax Code provides in part:

"If the Property Tax Appeal Board renders a decision lowering the assessment of a particular parcel after the deadline for filing complaints with the Board of Review or after adjournment of the session of the Board of Review at which assessments for the subsequent year are being considered, the taxpayer may, within 30 days after the date of written notice of the Property Tax Appeal Board's decision, appeal the assessment for the subsequent year directly to the Property Tax Appeal Board."

In order to comply with the above provision, YOU MUST FILE A PETITION AND EVIDENCE WITH THE PROPERTY TAX APPEAL BOARD WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DATE OF THE ENCLOSED DECISION IN ORDER TO APPEAL THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PROPERTY FOR THE SUBSEQUENT YEAR.

Based upon the issuance of a lowered assessment by the Property Tax Appeal Board, the refund of paid property taxes is the responsibility of your County Treasurer. Please contact that office with any questions you may have regarding the refund of paid property taxes.